



VYSOKÉ UČENÍ TECHNICKÉ V BRNĚ

BRNO UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY

FAKULTA VÝTVARNÝCH UMĚNÍ

FACULTY OF FINE ARTS

ATELIÉR PERFORMANCE

STUDIO OF PERFORMANCE

PERFORMATIVNÍ ZPROSTŘEDKOVÁNÍ A INTERPRETACE / MEZI NÁVODEM A DOKUMENTACÍ, MEZI SCÉNÁŘEM A ZÁZNAMEM

PERFORMATIVE MEDITATION AND INTERPRETATION / BETWEEN MANUAL AND
DOCUMENTATION, BETWEEN SCRIPT AND RECORD

TEZE DIZERTAČNÍ PRÁCE

DOCTORAL THESIS (SHORTENED VERSION)

AUTOR PRÁCE

AUTHOR

MgA. JENNIFER HELIA DE FELICE

VEDOUCÍ PRÁCE

SUPERVISOR

prof. akad. soch. TOMÁŠ RULLER

BRNO 2018

Abstrakt

Tato práce se zabývá zasazováním zkušenosti do rámce, aktem zrození, opakování a škálou notací, a nakonec pojmem otevřená partitura (open score). Je zde sledováno několik cest, ve kterých se prezentované přístupy a záměry spájejí do základního konceptu zpracování zkušenosti do partitury. Mezi různými styly a metodami ve vztahu k tomuto fenoménu jsou v práci prozkoumávány: hermeneutický přístup k interpretaci umění Hanse-Georga Gadamera v díle *Pravda a metoda*, estetická teorie Johna Deweyho v *Art as Experience*, vývoj notace a otevřené partitury, pravidla happeningu, slovní partitury (word score) a instrukce (event scores), forma manifestu a jeho role v umělecké praxi, návodné principy haiku, reperformance jako odkaz k minulosti a sociální výzkum, rekonstrukce událostí jako sociálně angažované umění, umělecká praxe ve vztahu k legislativě, týkající se pozemkových práv a volného pohybu v krajině. Primárním cílem práce je odhalit proces redukce výchozí zkušenosti skrze uměleckou metodologii, ústící do konečné volně interpretovatelné práce, která má formu otevřené partitury.

Klíčová slova: otevřená partitura, notace, zkušenost, performance, interpretace, reperformance, rekonstrukce, manifest

Abstract

This work deals with the framing of experience, the act of becoming, repetition, a notation spectrum, and, ultimately, the notion of the open score. Several avenues are pursued in which each of the various presented approaches and contemplations connect to the fundamental concept of the working of experience into a score. Among the various styles and methods which are investigated in relation to this phenomenon are Hans-Georg Gadamer's hermeneutic approach to the interpretation of art in *Truth and Method*, John Dewey's aesthetic theory in *Art as Experience*, the development of notation and the open score, the rules of the happening, word and event scores, the form of the manifesto and its role in artistic practice, the guiding principles of haiku, reperformance as legacy and social research, reenactment as socially engaged art, and artistic practice in relation to legislation concerning land access. The work's fundamental concern is to reveal the process of reducing an essential experience through artistic methodology, resulting in a final open interpretable work in the form of an open score.

Keywords: open score, notation, experience, performance, interpretation, reperformance, reenactment, manifesto

Bibliographic citation: Jennifer Helia DeFelice, *Performative mediation and interpretation Between instruction and documentation, between scenario and record*. Brno, 2018, 141 p. Dissertation, Faculty of Fine Art, Brno University of Technology. Prof. akad. soch. Tomáš Ruller.

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	5
PART I.....	9
I.1. On Interpretation.....	9
The Concept of Bildung.....	9
The Concept of Erlebnis.....	10
Intentional Fallacy.....	12
The Hermeneutic Circle.....	13
I.2. On Experience	15
From Raw to Refined.....	17
An Experience.....	18
Impulsion.....	19
Perception in Reconstruction.....	20
I.3. On Notation	21
Coloration.....	22
Relinquishing Control.....	23
Notations.....	23
Field Notation.....	25
Integrity.....	25
PART II.....	27
II.1. How to Make a Happening	27
Rules to the Game.....	27
Simultaneity.....	27
Time-Space.....	28
Spontaneity.....	29
II.2. The Event Score	30
Fluxus.....	30
In potentia.....	31
Micro-macro.....	32
II.3. The Manifesto.....	33
Tender Revolutionaries.....	33
The Mind Is the Muscle.....	35
Art Theory and Practice as Manifesto.....	37
1+1=3.....	38
Shapeshifting.....	39
Manifesto Machine.....	39
The Gentle Barbarian.....	39

II.4. Reduction to Essentials.....	40
Haiku.....	40
Interiority.....	41
Wabi-sabi.....	43
8-8-8.....	44
II.5. Becoming Actual.....	45
Reperformance	45
Presence.....	47
II.6. Exploiting the Quotidian.....	48
Reenactment and Socially Engaged Art.....	48
Contemporaneity.....	49
Delegated Performance.....	50
II.7. You Take the High Road and I'll Take the Low Road.....	52
Conclusion	56
III. Practical Application – Doctoral Project.....	57
Art-Research Bridge.....	57
Intuition Conference.....	58
Vašulka Kitchen Brno.....	59

Introduction

This work presents an in-depth look at the role of experience in the conception and interpretation of scores. It explores underlying themes including the framing of experience into a perceptible whole, the act of becoming and the recognition of presence, repetition and its role in artworks as events of fulfilled past and present time, the development of open notational systems, and the notion of the open score. Several views and contemplations are presented in this work in its investigation of the documentation of experience through notation and enactment. Various approaches and methods are investigated, including hermeneutic interpretation, experiential aesthetic theory, the relevance of the quotidian, graphic and language-based notation, reperformance and reenactment, the creation and utilization of manifestos, and the human step as a meter of creation in relation to land access and legislation. The work is fundamentally concerned with the examination of how meaning is relayed through the transfer of essential and significant experiences through methods that presuppose interpretation and implementation by a second party over an extended period of time via a particular set of instructions.

Performative reinterpretation has been granted legitimacy and has gained significant institutional attention since the turn of the twenty-first century. A precedent has been established in performance art and performative artistic practice. This work aims to explore performative repetition and patterns, the give and take between rules and processes, and the credence that is given to the interpreter by the author of an original score.

This work was inspired by the desire to grasp the underlying processes behind conceptual and improvisational performative practice. For the interpreter, the open score provides a window through which they connect with their audience in a dynamic elevated state. It is in these spaces that what has gone before, what has been lived, learned, or doubted becomes a shared experience. The work of art as both a meditated and precarious excursion, unfolding over time and held together as a compact piece perceived as a whole, is central to this work.

The first part of the dissertation develops an underlying philosophy and methodology for the creation and interpretation of scores. *On Interpretation* looks at Hans-Georg Gadamer's aesthetic theory of interpretation, particularly the concepts of *Erlebnis* (historical self-understanding) and *Bildung* (experience) as expressed in his philosophical work *Truth and Method*. Gadamer's

aesthetics are concerned with “what objectively informs our subjective awareness of art” through the discovery of the “cultural and linguistic realities” which are present in the work. Rather than art being removed from reality, aesthetic appearance is “the vehicle through which real subject matters reveal themselves.” Of primary importance to this work is the notion of the aesthetic experience being dialogical. The “practitioner and theoretician share in bringing a subject matter to light” through the means of interpretation via which a work is realized.¹ This provides a philosophical point of departure for understanding the phenomenon of works that are predetermined for re-creation and interpretation.

On Experience navigates themes central to John Dewey’s experiential aesthetic theory as expressed in *Art as Experience*. These themes are instrumental in explicating the function of experience in the *creation* and *interpretation* of an art work, with each being an essential component of the other. Dewey’s anti-dualism and blurring of dichotomies made a significant contribution to the emergence of art that focused on the everyday and on the concept of shared experience and discovery as opposed to personal expression and the notion of high art. His analysis of the phenomenon of experience provides important insight into experiential and research-based approaches to artistic creation.

The development of graphic notation and examples of styles and approaches to interpretational instruction are explored in the chapter *On Notation*. The scores featured in this chapter grant varying degrees of openness to the performer.

The second part of this work delves into specific manifestations of score-based and instructional work. The spectrum of examples is based on personal experiential research into the phenomenon of scores in relation to John Dewey’s concept of framing experience and is concerned with the localization of a holistic relationship between art and life. It is an attempt to inspect performative behavior in relation to, in dialogue with, or in opposition to: instructions, rules, societal mores, traditions, and legislation that codifies our actions. The most fundamental formula of the score is something taken from the experience of the world and something returned to it.

The eleven rules set out in Allan Kaprow’s *How to Make a Happening* set a precedent for the conception and understanding of what it means to create and be part of a *happening*. The term

¹ Nicholas Davey. *Gadamer’s Aesthetics*. In Zalta, E. N. (Ed.). Winter 2016. *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Accessed 3 May 2018. <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2016/entries/gadamer-aesthetics/>.

happening is applied broadly to institutional performative practice and societal performative instances. Kaprow's approach emphasized the erasure of the "audience" and freed the event from time constraints. He emphasized the seamless incorporation of the happening into the naturally occurring world, encouraging a practice that exists in symbiosis with everyday life and "real" or "experienced" time. The incorporation of sleep and work environments into this conception is raised using contemporary examples. Spontaneity and originality are of the utmost importance; hence Kaprow's instruction to perform a happening only once. Re-performance is justified through the creation of a "score" or "scenario" intended to maintain the essence of the work while specifically designed to ensure that each subsequent performance is naturally different from the previous one.

In the chapter *Event Scores*, the Fluxus movement and its members are given particular attention for their work with textual scores and for their exploration of objectified performative experience and expression. The use of words employed in notation is traced to the conceptual shift in musical composition and form that is represented most prevalently by the piece 4'33". Electronic music and the exploration of technology played significant roles in compositional methodology, expanding the notion of how and what is heard, how the experience of sound is embodied, and the enduring capacity of that experience by enabling the use of extended duration.

The Manifesto looks at the manifesto as a reflection of an experience of dissatisfaction and considers how it functions as a framework for action and production, serving socio-cultural-political aims through a call for action. Manifestos created by the avant-garde of the twentieth century are often characterized by their international overreach; successive manifestos within a movement often present a reinterpretation and development of an original proclamation. The application of a methodology of creative practice and theory as a manifesto is analyzed and its societal role is explored. Important shifts in poetic form and typography are referenced.

In order to examine the notion and application of instruction-based scores, the subject of the *haiku* form of poetry and its schematic form and content are inspected in the chapter *Reduction to Essentials*. The establishment of a schematic frame as an idealized form is examined, as are the fundamental conceptual characteristics that predicate the achievement of a *haiku* poem. The mutual influence of Western (American and European) and East Asian (Chinese and Japanese) cultures as they inform the resulting conception of *haiku* in its international manifestation is also referenced.

The rhythm and meter of *haiku* are considered as a means to contemplate underlying naturally occurring structure and form.

Becoming Actual looks at reperformance in terms of its ability to increase the legendary status of performance work and its use as a tool for artistic research into the power of performance to reveal societal alterations over time. The institutional reception and proliferation of performance work, and its mythological and prophetic qualities, has contributed to the establishment of seminal works as scores to be re-performed. The mediatization of artists' works is comparatively scrutinized while a case for the iconic status of particular artists and their artistic philosophies are presented as an indispensable quality of their work.

The chapter *Exploiting the Quotidian* considers re-enactment and socially engaged art that employs participatory and delegated performances. Historical and contemporary issues are addressed through this form, applying a strategy of artistic practice that addresses societal tensions by creatively navigating societal tensions, commemorating, and activating through collaboration and community. Specific examples of historical reenactment are looked at, and the concept of contemporaneity is addressed in terms of tradition and its ability to bridge past experience with present experience, thereby creating shared meaning. The application of socially engaged and delegated performance as an effective method of social critique and a tool for generating dialogue is traced.

You Take the High Road and I'll Take the Low Road explores works that utilize walking as a tool in creative expression, with an emphasis on walks that are related to identity. This chapter touches on the theme of pilgrimage and trekking and on the establishment of routes in the Central European region and their ensuing significance for artistic creation within the natural environment. The role of legislation and its interpretation is addressed as it relates to the creation of works that use walking and access to the countryside as a methodology in their creative process. Perambulation as a nuanced form of inquiry serves as a metaphor for instruction-based creation and interpretation.

PART I

I.1. On Interpretation

Hans-Georg Gadamer explores the methodology of natural sciences as it is applied in the human sciences. He references Hermann von Helmholtz and his distinction between two types of induction: “logical and artistic-instinctive induction.”² Scientific knowledge presupposes a separation from life history; the human sciences apply the use of comparative methods that do not create an object out of history, but rather carry history within itself. The inferred methodology in the human sciences emphasizes “memory and authority” and employs a psychological tact that replaces coming to conclusions. Gadamer emphasizes the “concept of self-formation, education, or cultivation (*Bildung*)” as formed in the human sciences of the eighteenth century and applied in the nineteenth century as one of the primary “guiding concepts of humanism.” This concept shifts interpretation from a preoccupation with canons and historicizing to that of a “historical self-understanding.”³

The Concept of *Bildung*

Gadamer traces the etymology of the word *Bildung* from its “origin in medieval mysticism” through the definition Johann Gottfried Herder gives it: “rising up to humanity through culture.”⁴ Gadamer details how Immanuel Kant further develops the concept of *Bildung* (cultivating a natural talent as an act of freedom by the acting subject), as does Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel (educating and cultivating oneself); Wilhelm von Humboldt differentiates it from *Kultur* as being “something both higher and more inward, namely the disposition of mind which, from the knowledge and the feeling of the total intellectual and moral endeavor, flows harmoniously into sensibility and character.”⁵

Through tracing Hegel’s application of *Bildung* in his philosophy, Gadamer arrives at the conclusion that *Bildung* develops the power of abstraction. *Bildung* is a path toward cultivation of self-awareness in pursuit of the universal. Gadamer identifies a form of practical *Bildung*, providing

² Hans-Georg Gadamer. 2013. *Truth and Method*. London and New York: Bloomsbury Academic. p. 5.

³ *Ibid.*, 9.

⁴ Michael Eldridge in *The German Bildung Tradition* explains Herder’s understanding of the concept of *Bildung* as “the totality of experiences that provide a coherent identity, and sense of common destiny, to a people.”

⁵ Hans-Georg Gadamer. *Truth and Method*. 10.

the example given by Hegel in his *Propaedeutic*⁶ as “taking the universal upon oneself” and overcoming that which does not come naturally to the individual. From this practical concept of *Bildung*, Gadamer moves to the concept of theoretical *Bildung*. Gadamer expands this notion by expressing how any individual in the pursuit of the spiritual must achieve a knowledge of the customs and institution of one’s own culture. This is an ongoing process in the attempt to go beyond one’s “naturalness.” In order to move beyond the notion of *Bildung* in terms of achieving absolute spirit, and of the pursuit of absolute knowledge in philosophy (Hegel), Gadamer focuses on “artistic feeling and tact” (Helmholtz). This differs from the tact that we know as social custom, although it may share the same “feeling and unconscious”. Here however, it is also a “mode of knowing and a mode of being.” *Bildung* is an essential component of this tact. In order to achieve this “one must have a sense of the aesthetic and the historical; it is not a given but rather an acquired ability. What results is what is termed “a universal sense,” in which there exists a “receptivity to otherness,” an ability to achieve distance from one’s personal interests and goals in order to remain “open” to possible others; a “cultivated consciousness ... active in all directions.”⁷ By developing this notion of tact, Gadamer illustrates how the human sciences differ from modern science, which is defined by the nineteenth century methodology of hypothetico-deductivism.⁸

The Concept of *Erlebnis*

In *Truth and Method*, Gadamer looks closely at the aesthetics of genius and the concept of experience (*Erlebnis*) after a detailed account of the subjectivization of aesthetics via the scrutiny of Kantian aesthetic theory. Gadamer points out that Kant’s concept of genius, developed as a transcendental principle for artistic beauty, is well suited as a universal aesthetic principle in that the concept of genius is immutable in the stream of time, unlike the concept of taste, which is a “testimony to the mutability of all human things and the relativity of human values,”⁹ and which had become marginalized along with the problem of beauty in nature. In aesthetics, taste gives way

⁶ G. W. F. Hegel. 1808-11. *The Philosophical Propaedeutic*.

“Practical Education [Bildung] entails that man, in the gratification of his natural wants and impulses, shall exhibit that prudence and temperance which lie in the limits of his necessity, namely, self-preservation. He must (a) stand away from and be free from the natural (b) on the other hand, be absorbed in his avocation, in what is essential and therefore, (c) be able to confine his gratification of the natural wants not only within the limits of necessity but also to sacrifice the same for higher duties.”

⁷ Ibid., 16.

⁸ Ibid., 17.

Gadamer offers the example of applying historical circumstances to the interpretation and validity of miracles as expressed in the bible to the detriment of Christianity.

⁹ Gadamer, Hans-Georg. *Truth and Method*. 53.

to the “phenomenon of art and the concept of genius.”¹⁰

Gadamer traces the word *Erlebnis* to its earliest general usage. Its verb form, *Erleben*, appears earlier, and was frequently used in the age of Goethe. *Erleben* means primarily “to be still alive when something happens” or “what one has experienced oneself.” Both of these meanings clearly contributed to the development of *Erlebnis*, “both the immediacy, which precedes all interpretation, reworking, and communication, and merely offers a starting point for interpretation—material to be shaped—and its discovered yield, its lasting result.”¹¹

Erlebnis is a productive union between these two concepts, that of having had the experience oneself, and that of the lasting impression or importance that becomes an integral part of it.¹² The experience, as a framed unit, is a part of the whole. “In contrast to the abstractness of understanding and the particularity of perception or representation, this concept implies a connection with totality, with infinity.”¹³ Each individual act “as an element of life” falls into succession which maintains a permanent connection with “the infinite of life that manifests itself in it.” “Everything finite is an expression, a representation of the infinite.”¹⁴ The word *Erlebnis*, as it was coined, was a criticism of the Enlightenment’s rationalism and is directly related to the rebellion against bourgeois culture and its institutions, a rejection of the mechanization of life in contemporary mass society. *Erlebnis* is localized in a position between speculation and empiricism and dominated by the question of what is truly given.

Through tracing Wilhelm Dilthey’s formulation of the concept of “lived experience” via “reflexivity” and “interiority,” Gadamer reveals how the past can be made present through knowledge of the historical world. Rather than “data of experiment and measurement” we are working with “units of meaning” instead, which are “units of experience.”¹⁵ Gadamer likewise traces how the concept of experience serves an epistemological function in Edmund Husserl’s phenomenology. For Husserl, the unit of experience is understood as an intentional relation, rather than a piece of the actual flow of experience of an individual. Experience is given weight in this instance. Instead of being something that is happening to us, it is imbibed with meaning through its purpose and intention, by design. This is not to say that non-intentional experiences do not exist;

¹⁰ Ibid., 54.

¹¹ Ibid., 53.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Ibid., 57.

¹⁴ Ibid., 58.

¹⁵ Ibid., 59.

however, these are “merely material for units of meaning, intentional experiences.” For Husserl, “experience becomes the comprehensive name for all acts of consciousness whose essence is intentionality.”¹⁶

Gadamer considers works of art to be worlds unto themselves, the aesthetic experience of which then runs parallel to our actuality. Through this aesthetic experience, we are removed from the flow of our own experience while at the same time it relates back to the whole of one’s existence. It is within this experience of art that we encounter a “fullness of meaning,” a meaning which, while brought to us by the work of art, does not belong to it exclusively. The creation and interpretation of scores and the “open score” in particular, make good use of *Erlebnis*. The integrity that is assumed on behalf of the interpreter presumes an ability to connect with the work in a way that can only be understood through the experience of the work.

Intentional Fallacy

In their essay *The Intentional Fallacy*¹⁷ W. K. Wimsatt, Jr. and Monroe C. Beardsley present a series of what they deem self-evident truths concerning authorial intention in terms of the interpretation of a work. Their ideas challenged what had been a widely accepted approach of qualifying criticism based on a view of the author’s intention.

Their five propositions focus on why the interpretation and criticism of a work should not be shaped by original intention as it is neither available to us or desirable. The work itself embodies the intention on which the reader (viewer) must focus. This is not a dismissal of original intent; it is rather an affirmation of this intent as it is present in and expressed through the work itself from which we must derive our interpretation. Beardsley’s stance is that the author’s intention is of no relevance to the work of art at all. However, in his text *The Author*, Andrew Bennet references both Wimsatt’s essay *Genesis: A Fallacy Revisited*¹⁸ and Beardsley’s essay *Intentions and Interpretations*;¹⁹ each author revisits *The Intentional Fallacy* and their own intention to “discipline the discipline” of literary criticism, purging it of the preoccupation with the flux of gossip,

¹⁶ Ibid., 60.

¹⁷ W. K. Wimsatt and Monroe C. Beardsley. 1946. *The Intentional Fallacy*. In *The Sewanee Review* (54/3). Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press. pp. 468-488.

¹⁸ David Newton-de Molina. (Ed.). 1976. *On Literary Intention, Critical Essays*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. pp. 116-138.

¹⁹ Michael Wreen and Donald M. Callen. (Eds.). *The Aesthetic Point of View: Selected Essays*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press. pp. 188-207.

biography, moral admonition, and social history that riddled literary criticism at the time of their essay's publication. Their work was a successful attempt to transform literary criticism into an "austerely literary, rigorously linguistic, and astringently intellectual" practice. Bennet states that Wimsett and Beardsley were not actually suggesting a dismissal of authorial intention; rather, they intended to shed light on how complex and complicated the matter of intention was. The critic should be occupied with the evidence of intention as it is legible in the work itself as opposed to getting caught up in the "*extra-textual* thoughts, wishes, desires, experiences, life or indeed the imagined or separately documented 'intentions' of the author."²⁰

E. D. Hirsch differentiates between meaning and significance in that the author's intention is its meaning but what we take away from the work is its significance. Hirsch asserts that to know the artist's intention is to know the work's meaning. This differentiation does not exist in Gadamer's proposal, in which meaning and significance blur: where one leaves off, the other takes over. The ability to secure the distinction between the two is highly unlikely. This is what Gadamer refers to as a "fusing of horizons." There is a virtual gap in the transition between the author and the recipient; each reading fills this space in its own way as an exchange takes place between the work and the interpreter. Scores present a unique situation requiring the performer to interpret through an act of completion which sees the actual creation of the work.

The Hermeneutic Circle

The principles of interpretation and the systematic hermeneutic study of how we interpret the world were arrived at through the proliferation of religious treatises after the Protestant Reformation. The need for an individual interpretation or reading of religious texts and the influence of this need on interpretational theory may shed light on the interpretation and performance of scores. Texts were concerned with moral and aesthetic questions until the eighteenth century, after which an emphasis was placed on the spiritual insight of the author, like the Divine creator, and the emphasis shifted to the importance of genius, with the author functioning as an intermediary between worlds. When perceiving, we bring to the table what Gadamer refers to as "prejudices"; we see through our own world-views, which are limited by the references and contexts that characterize us as individuals. In this sense, meaning becomes of prime importance. Through the rise of constitutional democracy and the expansion of the natural sciences, the focus shifts from interpreting religious treatises to the interpretation of laws. Here we see the development of hermeneutic philosophy within the

²⁰ Andrew Bennet. 2005. *The Author*. New York: Routledge. pp. 76-77.

humanities. Texts on literature in the eighteenth century were concerned with raising and evaluating moral and aesthetic questions and with the transparency of meaning. But meaning can be difficult to grasp, and an interpretive method may either engage with or miss the author's intention.²¹ With scores, the question of the author's intention is hybrid situation, in which to some degree the language for interpretation is introduced or specific instructions accompany the piece. Scores that are conceived as open in nature purposely blur the line between the intentionality of the author and the interpreter.

The hermeneutic circle describes the relationship between the work and the author, with the work functioning as a mediatory document. There is a circuit of communication that stays open, flowing back and forth between the work and the viewer/reader/interpreter, referencing and merging historical, social and cultural horizons. Here the focus is not on subjective pleasures but rather on what objectively "informs our subjective awareness of art"²² through referencing back and forth. In this way, the past and the present exist in a relationship, the premise being that the past has something to tell us. It is through this back and forth movement that we become acquainted with the parts of the work that can inform our understanding of the whole. A relationship is established between the past and the present in which what one knows informs the interpretation while providing an entry point for deciphering the meaning of the work. Interpretive comprehension is thus achieved. Interpretation is also concerned with the preconceptions one brings to a work through "habits of thought" rather than by focusing on the work itself. This is described as the "first, last, and constant task."

The score is designed with a certain level of openness as a fundamental part of its conception, the work is to be completed through its enactment. The reader's initial projection of meaning is continuously revised through expectation, or fore-projection, enabling the reader to penetrate into the meaning of the work and arrive at a complex understanding. The movement is between understanding and interpretation. This is not to imply the interpreter's unique objective position, but rather to inspect the legitimacy, "the origin and validity" of the fore-meaning "dwelling within" themselves. Gadamer refers to the moment in which we recognize that we are confronted with an instance that requires our active participation, calling this the "experience of being pulled up short." When we are unable to arrive at a meaning or the meaning does not match our expectations, we are

²¹ Paul Fry. *Ways in and out of the Hermeneutic Circle. Theory of Literature (ENGL 300)*. Open Yale Courses. Yale University. Based on lecture notes.

²² Nicholas Davey. 2016. *Gadamer's Aesthetics*. In *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edward N. Zalta (Ed.).

alerted, we are required to remain open to the meaning encompassed within the work while staying aware of how our own fore-meaning is completed or challenged.

Hermeneutic interpretation requires the awareness of one's own biases and an openness to the work speaking to them. Understanding is as much contingent on our prejudices as it is on our history. The situation in which we find ourselves with the effect of history upon our consciousness is an awareness of the hermeneutic situation, which Gadamer refers to as our "horizon" determined by our "historically-determined situatedness." Through our prejudices being brought into question and the encounter with another, our understanding is susceptible to revision, altered through a process of mutual agreement. Here, what Gadamer refers to as a "fusion of horizons," takes place. There is a gap between the viewer/reader/interpreter and the work; this gap requires negotiation and bridging. It is within these gaps, which challenge perception and activate communication, that the mergence of historical, social, cultural and personal horizons manifest and happen.

I.2. On Experience

John Dewey is most renown for his progressive concepts of education reform which to a large degree have been implemented in some shape or form into the Western contemporary education system. Dewey places an emphasis on experiential learning and the non-hierarchical collaborative exchange between student and pedagogue. His approach is centered around an interdisciplinary immersive approach in which the acquisition and application of knowledge must be navigated through the experience of problem solving and differentiated instructional techniques. His advocacy for participatory social democracy went hand in hand with his utopian notion of education as a means to creating independent creative human beings who would be instrumental in creating a free and democratic society. Dewey's focus on experience is akin to phenomenologist methodology. His anti-dualism found him engaged in eliminating perceptions of divergency thwarting the presupposition that "ethereal meanings and values are inaccessible to sense."²³

John Dewey investigates the fluid exchange between knowledge and experience as it pertains to art and life in his aesthetic theory *Art as Experience* (1934). Dewey's replacement of the question "what is art?" with "when is art?" is shared with Nelson Goodman²⁴ who, although similarly to

²³ Thomas Leddy. *Dewey's Aesthetics* in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. (Winter 2016 Edition). Zalta, E. N. (Ed.).

²⁴ Nelson Goodman. 1978. *Ways of Worldmaking*. Indianapolis & Cambridge: Hackett Publishing Company. p. 57.

Dewey has a naturalist approach to the arts, sees art in terms of language and other symbol systems, rather than experience.²⁵ Dewey's concept places emphasis on the continuity of art rather than on its autonomy, his point of departure the live creature in its environment. It seems appropriate that Dewey's legacy was given due attention elsewhere, in the practical application of his phenomenological theory of aesthetic and artistic experience. Performance art pioneer Allan Kaprow carefully studied Dewey's theory in the early stages of his university education.²⁶

Dewey links intelligence and values to human needs and social circumstances which can be lived and experienced in the everyday. In order to reunite art and art making with the substance of life, Dewey opens his thesis with a critic of artistic practice in the post-industrial western society. For Dewey art has come to be understood as the assignment of aesthetic experience to objects and events rather than to the conditions of their origin which traditionally lent them their validity and significance. The exhibition and acceptance of art in the west, at the time when Dewey is composing his theory, is framed by the qualification of taste, the expertise of the critic and the historian, and established conventions of presentation and display.²⁷ The delegation and framing of art in the context of the museum or gallery is viewed as the legacy of imperialism and war, capitalism and mechanisms that have served to remove art from life and its centering in community.

He advocates for a holistic view of the arts that include the practices and artifacts of traditional culture viewed as "enhancements of everyday life" in their original contexts. For Dewey the work of art comes into being through one's experience of it. The work of art is the intensified experience rather than the object itself. The relegation of the work into an institutional construct isolates it from the "the conditions from within which they came to be, and hence from their experiential function."²⁸ The appreciation of art and its perception are joined together in experiential aesthetics. Conscious experience presupposes "doing and undergoing" simultaneously. Production and consumption are not viewed as separate but as necessary qualities of artistic satisfaction which must be linked to the activity that caused it to come about. A heightened state of awareness of these

²⁵ Thomas Leddy. *Dewey's Aesthetics* in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

²⁶ *Ibid.*

Dewey is credited with having significant influence on Josef Albers, an influential painting teacher at Black Mountain College ideologically based on Dewey's principles of education. He is credited with having strongly influenced Abstract Expressionism. Robert Motherwell studied Art as Experience at Stanford and considered it his bible. Donald Judd also read and admired Dewey.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, xii.

²⁸ *Ibid.*

processes is a necessary prerequisite of comprehension, yet this is not considered an intellectual endeavor, but rather an ability to relate qualities to one another.

From Raw to Refined

Dewey turns toward the raw material of aesthetic experience in order to comprehend the refined. To this end he looks to, and exalts events and scenes from everyday life referencing traditional cultures and the enhancement of life through cultural artifacts. The environment is not only perceived as the backdrop of life but something that we actively interact with; the rhythmic resolution of tension, the alteration between unity and disunity, results in harmony and equilibrium in humans. Objects are instrumental in the resolution of breaks in our experience which we perceive as emotion. Through reflective action, thought can be incorporated into objects as their meaning. By working and thinking in their medium, artists' cultivate the skill of achieving a unified experience through the incorporation of resistance and tension. The live creature is in a constant state of cumulative change, "losing and reestablishing equilibrium with its environment."²⁹ Dewey sees nature as having emotional qualities and direct experience as a function of man/nature interaction in which human energy is transformed. This concept is analogous to improvised performance in terms of its precarious nature which needs to be navigated actively in real time. Dewey does not mean to imply that aesthetic experience is concerned with pleasantries. On the contrary there are challenging and painful processes that are involved in the formation of an encapsulated experience.

Dewey does not differentiate between experience and aesthetic experience. For him the aesthetic is an indivisible component of experience rather than an exterior product thereof. Close attention is paid to the awareness of the process of experience as an ongoing phenomenon. The actual formation of what would be labeled "an experience" is contingent on the awareness, the focused attention that "the live creature" has, as events unfold.

Although there is a continuous unfolding of experience within one's lifetime, there are those which we are able to encapsulate into a whole which have unity and closure. For Dewey we are active participants in a process that is concerned with receptivity rather than passivity. This is an innately human process where sense, need, impulse and action are united. The approach is concerned with

²⁹ Ibid.

mutual understanding rather than with norms. Rituals and customs, rather than norms, are concerned with heightened states of awareness.

The unity of experiences can be defined as the synergy of past and future in the present. It is the heightened state of active engagement with the world within which one is able to identify themselves. Dewey sees this as the moment of germination of art. Observation, action and foresight precede the thought and action of artistic creation. “Art celebrates with peculiar intensity the moments in which the past reinforces the present and in which the future is quickening of what now is.”³⁰

Ritual and custom do follow a certain score. These lend us certainty while allowing us to engage in a dialogue, to infuse a certain structure with our contemporary being. They are a way of having a dialogue with the history of the world. These may be open to varying degrees, inevitably there are minute alterations and developments which take place in a barely perceptible process of enactment and interpretation. The process of having “an experience” and having the ability to distill the essence of that experience is of crucial importance concerning how a work is formed, and how it will be applicable for future interpretations.

An Experience

Dewey offers a definition of what is the pivotal concept of his aesthetic theory, “*an experience.*” Life is understood as an assemblage of histories with pervasive qualities; all of its dramatic elements, its twists and fulfillments, ebbs and flows. Dewey’s description is helpful in demonstrating how we experience music or performance. We are aware of the piece as a whole and yet it is defined by its movement through time and how we are able to move through the piece conceptually, always conscious of the preceding elements that constitute it as a whole. In order to characterize the experience we seek out a particular quality that best encapsulates it. An experience is presented as a development of an underlying quality rather than as successive events as linked by association.³¹

Dewey’s description of the holistic quality of an experience is indeed reminiscent of a meditation on musical notation, poetry recitation, or the dramatic arts. This unity or wholeness is the aesthetic

³⁰ Ibid., 17.

³¹ Thomas Leddy. *Dewey’s Aesthetics* in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

for Dewey. The attained integration of the properties of an experience is felt as “harmony.” Aesthetic experience is satisfying because it is integrated. This notion is noteworthy for its ability to fuse author and audience into integrated subject/object. It follows that for Dewey science and art are not measured by separate criteria. Nevertheless, philosophical and scientific inquiries “may be summarized in a “truth” while in art there is no such thing.”³² He looks for order and organized movement. This is achieved retroactively, it is something gained.

In the composition of a work this comprehensive quality is strived for, in the performance of a work it is a necessary prerequisite. The uncertainty within an open score calls for the creation of an experience in real time. This is true as well for the listener/audience/perceiver. Aaron Copland refers to the “gifted listener” who “lends himself to the power of music, he gets both the “event” and the idealization of the “event”; he is inside the “event” so to speak [...].”³³ The listener must rely on their own skill; “analysis and experience and imagination must combine to give us the assurance that we have made our own the composer’s complex of ideas.”³⁴

Impulsion

In *The Act of Expression* Dewey begins with a the description of what he calls an *impulsion* as opposed to the term *impulse* in a way to differentiate between that which is a movement outward and forward of the entire organism and what are considered auxiliary mechanisms. Here he is primarily concerned with an organism’s dependence on its environment for the completion of the experience initiated through the impulsion. He continues to emphasize the fact that the living creature must interact with an environment that is not under the control of that creature meaning that there are both favoring and adverse circumstances. Once the action is initiated it becomes imbued with meaning and intent. If the circumstances that are encountered in the environment were always favorable, there would be no need to recount the experience in which no objects would be deemed significant.

He further describes the balance between push and pull in the ensuing realization of an impulsion is a desired state and that “what is evoked is [...] a transformation of energy into thoughtful action, through the assimilation of meaning from the background of past experiences.” Where the new and

³² Thomas Leddy. *Dewey’s Aesthetics* in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

³³ Aaron Copland. 1952. *Music and Imagination*. New York, Toronto: The New American Library. p. 20.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, 26.

the old intersect we see a re-creation rather than a linear composition. The present “impulsion” is given form and weight, the stored or old is “given new life and soul through having to meet a new situation.”³⁵

Dewey states that not all outgoing activity is that of expression, however, he observes how things in the environment that would be hardly considered become means, or “media.”

The mere release of emotion is not an adequate condition of expression for Dewey. There must be a *carrying forward in development*, a working out to completion, an administration of objective conditions, a shaping of materials in the interest of embodying the excitement otherwise there is no expression.³⁶ He differentiates between acts of expression and those of mere discharge; the discharge of emotion through manifested behavior, reaction and those which are characterized by *meaning* through an understanding arrived at through awareness of response. He touches upon a moment of insincerity which occurs when there is a split between what is done and its purpose. He likens the ability to manage and order one’s activities in reference to their consequences to art making. The aim is the consequence arrived at through learned natural spontaneous and unintended activities, or more precisely their incorporation after the perception and understanding of the relationship between doing and undergoing.

Perception in Reconstruction

There is a continuity in Dewey’s attention to the erasure of boundaries and the fluid interplay between binaries. The perceiver is given a role of responsibility in his aesthetics. The interpreter relies on past experience which serve as cues for the most basic form of identification. This is a process of recognition in which the application of a “bare outline for the present object” is sufficient. This precedes the task of “taking in” when “perception replaces bare recognition”.

The active process of perception is the creation of one's own experience in which their creation “must include relations comparable to those which the original producer underwent.” These are not equivalent reactions, feelings, or literal reproductions. Dewey gives the perceiver a responsibility in the fruition of aesthetic experience. Mere “appreciation” based on “learning with conformity to norms of conventional admiration” will not suffice and is ingenuous.

³⁵ Ibid., 63.

³⁶ Ibid.

This is a compelling theory in terms of the performance of works that require the active participation of the interpreter. In these cases we see a literal example of the process of bridging the aesthetic experience, here between artist and artist. This is clearly perceptible in the performance of improvised music based on graphic scores, but is apparent in the creation of participatory works, and performative recreations.

I.3. On Notation

The point and the line are the common denominators of musical notation and of the myriad forms of graphic notation that have developed through history. Paul Klee began his *Pedagogical Sketchbook* with this description, "An active line on a walk, moving freely, without goal. A walk for a walk's sake. The mobility agent, is a point, shifting its position forward."³⁷ Klee's theory of art presented through a gradual progression of mark-making from point to line to plane creates the foundation for the exploration of visual composition. Dimensions are able to be psychologically correct although not necessarily logically correct. Gravitational laws are explicated in terms of inertia and continuity. The organization of movement is presented as a "calm-dynamic," "dynamic-calm" harmonization of elements. Through the application of a visual vocabulary and the employment of imagination new meaning can be induced.

Spectrograms map the time and frequency of a sound, each along one axis. Patrick Feaster takes an in-depth look at the visual registration of sound from the earliest known examples of their notation.³⁸ He looks at the various historic inscriptions of sound. Feaster then plays both waveforms and spectrograms using digital programs to sonify the images he discovered through his extensive research.

The *Musica enchiriadis* and the *Scolica enchiriadis* are two pieces dating back to the Middle Ages (ninth century) that are the earliest treatises detailing modal theory and polyphony; the pieces are known for their description of Daseian notation. Daseian notation is characterized by a precise pitch notation, which was used before the five-line staff in musical notation. Daseian notation used a staff ranging from four to eighteen lines.³⁹ The scale used in the written work is based on a system of tetrachords (a series of four notes) created solely for use in the work, rather than taken from musical

³⁷ Paul Klee. 1972. *Pedagogical Sketchbook*. New York, Washington: Praeger Publishers. p. 16.

³⁸ Patrick Feaster. 2012. *Pictures of Sound: One Thousand Years of Educated Audio 980-1980*. Atlanta: Dust to Digital.

³⁹ Willi Apel. 1953. *The Notation of Polyphonic Music 900-1600*. Cambridge: The Mediaeval Academy of America. p. 204.

practice. Daseian notation is a combination of text, a separate rectangular frame containing the tetrachords, and clusters of grouped symbols positioned at higher or lower locations on the page connected by lines. These clusters, resembling constellations, run parallel to one another, indicating polyphonic voices.⁴⁰

Coloration

The term “coloration” entered musical notation theory in the fourteenth century, when red notes began to be used to indicate variations from values that were written as black notes. In mensural notation from the fourteenth to the sixteenth century, coloration was used to mark the notes in terms of durational value. Later, a change in the durational value of a note was indicated by either a black note or a white or hollow note, as in contemporary staff notation. White mensural notation uses specific symbols which eventually evolved into what is known as black notation.

Inflected marks known as “neume” were the basic element of Western musical notation in the fifteenth century and the predecessor to staff notation as it is used today. A four-line musical staff eventually accompanied the neumes; this was used instead of heightened or lowered markings to indicate pitch. Articulation, duration, or tempo was indicated through the use of additional interpretive symbols, juxtaposed with neumes.⁴¹

The details of the development and history of notation are of interest in terms of the systematization of markings and symbols to visually represent the aural perception and experience of music. Notation written or printed in an arranged order so as to represent an aggregate can be called a score. The score as a document includes parameters and either a legend or key to their decoding, or a mutual understanding of a given system for its decipherment, its interpretation. Interpretations range from informed, strictly adhering to a specific style of notation and performance to pieces that are used more as a guide or a map; these may be referred to as “open scores.”

⁴⁰ Malanie Spiller. 2017. *Music Notation Explorations: The Dasia System*.

⁴¹ Wikipedia, s.v. *Neume*.

Relinquishing Control

Scores were taken in various directions during the 1950s when authors began to relinquish control over different aspects of their work. Scores began to present particular challenges concerning their interpretation due to the myriad systems that vary from composer to composer. The graphic symbols used in standard notation were transformed and adapted in various ways in graphic scores to indicate such elements as microtonal accidentals, pitch, notes, clusters, and chords, represented by lines, shapes, and color. The instruments to be played and the numbers of players range from being specifically defined to completely open.

Notations

In 1968 John Cage and Alison Knowles edited and published *Notations*, a collection of 269 “music manuscripts,” compiled by circumstance rather than a process of selection, in which they “show the many directions in which music notation is now going.” The collection is ordered alphabetically by name, but the texts by or about the works, including the typography were determined through chance operations.⁴² Inspired by *Notations*, Theresa Sauer published a collection of graphic scores titled *Notations 21* in 2009. Sauer describes her endeavor as an effort to “explore new developments in musical notation.” Her motivation was to “introduce people to the fascinating world of innovative notation and graphic scores but also to provide a forum for composers, a new way of bringing awareness of their compositions and philosophies to the forefront of the musical collective consciousness, aided by new technologies and media not available to Cage in the 1960s.”⁴³

In both collections scores range in their visual appearance from those reminiscent of classical scores through the use of staved paper or the inclusion of elements of classical notation symbols. Moving into a more visually conceptual realm we see the development of shapes and the employment of lines to indicate duration, articulation, or perhaps repetition. The size of forms can be interpreted in numerous manners as can the color or combination of colors encompassed in a piece. Forms may have varying geometrical qualities.

In classic grand staff notation an X is used instead of a black point to represent a sound or noise of determinate pitch, for example in percussion notation. In graphic scores the X can be used to

⁴² John Cage. 1969. *Notations*. 4.

⁴³ Theresa Sauer. 2009. *Notations 21*. 11.

indicate an indeterminate pitch, or rather a pitch of the performer's choice. This is achieved by removing the staff altogether. The same can be accomplished by using the tails of notes without defined note heads. Dots, Xs, small circles, or squares are often used to indicate individual notes. In other cases, notes may be indicated by lines, which invoke duration as a line is followed with the mind's eye and interpreted by the performer. Although the staff may not be included in the visual piece, the reading is often interpreted as in staved music, where the height of a line governs the approximate pitch of the note. The change in the shape or thickness of a line may be interpreted as changes in the dynamics of the sound. Changes in the quality of lines or their placement are often reflected by players as changes in pitch. Notes may be represented by one symbol and duration in another manner, or a combination of the two such as in Anestis Logothetis' *Paysage de temps*, which has layered visual audio tracks with a complex durational structure worked into the drawing, reminiscent of a landscape as its title suggests.

Earle Brown's *December '52*⁴⁴ is an elegant score comprised of 31 vertical and horizontal rectangles and lines. In Notations 21, Brown's text does not refer to this specific piece but rather reveals something of his notational and performance concerns. He likens his approach to a painter creating a set of directions that would enable a person to paint an image in all of its detail as the painter would have himself. Eric Andersen offers a different take on Brown's notion of directions using text rather than image (these not being mutually exclusive), as the premise in his score *I Have Confidence in You* (1965). He presents the entire alphabet in upper- and lower-case letters, basic punctuation, and the numerals 0 through 9 placed in three lines, relinquishing all control to the interpreter and the infinite possibilities the symbols represent.

Another method used in graphic scores is called cell notation or frame notation. Through the containment of phrases or motives using framing of other confining shapes or outlines, sentences or gestures can be specific while the order or revisitation of these themes can be left open. They may include standard notation, graphic symbols or a combination of various techniques or styles of notation. Cells can also be nested within one another. Duration may or may not be indicated in the score.

⁴⁴ *December '52* is an excerpt from the piece FOLIO 1952/1953.

Field Notation

Field notation is perhaps most closely related to the concept of a creative plane as it is used in two-dimensional works of art. The open plane can be handled in various manners representing the sonic spectrum. It can be thought of as an aerial perspective or a birds-eye view. Here, the way a performer moves through the piece can simulate animals moving through a field.⁴⁵ The field may also be conceived of as a time-space including narrative imagery that gives rise to more allegorical interpretations, perhaps with a film-like quality. Examples include detailed instruction and those that are left open for interpretation in terms of pitch, duration and dynamic changes. Scores are generally read from left to right with “up” representing higher notes and “down” representing lower notes; this is a generally accepted norm. The interpretation is entirely dependent on how the piece is drawn.

Integrity

The integrity assumed on the part of the interpreter is an important aspect of the open score as a medium, where the common denominator can be as simple as being human. The more instruction given regarding how the piece is to be performed, the longer the list of prerequisites becomes. Instrumentation may be indicated, but the level of virtuosity or professionalism can only be deduced based on the elements, either linguistic or semiotic. Additional instruction or historicizing of such pieces may be based on biographical and autobiographical material that are not an integral part of the score, on the development and methodology of the composer’s oeuvre, on musicology, and even on actual experiences of the interpretation of the score itself. To this end, registrations of performances in the form of audiovisual documentation have served to preserve the most well-known instances of interpretations, and these later serve as touchstones for future endeavors.

Thomas DeLio provides a detailed description of Christian Wolff’s notational language in his deconstruction of the piece *For 1, 2, or 3 People*. The score is “indeterminate with respect to all sonic parameters and any specific morphological propensity.” Cage referred to Wolff’s music as

⁴⁵ Guy De Bièvre. 2012. *Open, Mobile and Indeterminate Forms*. p. 155

De Bièvre describes in his thesis how his scores are to be understood as a “field” through which the performers roam. In a conversation with the composer he explained how in his work he moves through one of his graphic composition like cows move through a field; a concept he originally learned from trombonist Peter Zummo that has since played a major role in his work.

being a process rather than a time object.⁴⁶ DeLio identifies “three fundamental components of Wolff’s language of actions – initiation, coordination and transformation.”⁴⁷ Through his indications of actions Wolff allows the performers to arrive at a complex interaction of processes and gestures which have no set “melodic contour” or “sonic configuration.”⁴⁸

Wolff’s score is characterized by the coordination of action and response and their blending and blurring. Rather than setting down a record of an experience, the performers are set on a course of their own mutual experience, guided through diverse situations in a heightened state of awareness.

In the piece *Performance Corridor* (1968), Nauman uses the mechanics of performance in order to allow the viewer to have the same experience as himself. In a limited space, a corridor, “the viewer becomes both the subject and the object of his own experience.” Rather than recreating his own experience, Nauman invites the viewers to activate the experience themselves; the artwork becoming an “occasion for pure consciousness” through “externalizing the experience of art.”⁴⁹

⁴⁶ John Cage. 1961. *Silence*. Middletown: Wesleyan University Press. pp. 38-39.

⁴⁷ Thomas DeLio. *Circumscribing the Open Universe*. 62.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, 64.

⁴⁹ *Ibid.*, 52-53.

PART II

II.1. How to Make a Happening

Rules to the Game

In the recording of the lecture *How to Make a Happening*⁵⁰ (1966), Kaprow describes the eleven rules for the creation of a Happening. There are eleven rules to the “game” in its entirety, together forming a manifesto of an approach to making art in a fresh and provocative manner, distancing himself from whatever it is that is reminiscent of culture. He emphasizes the necessity of finding inspiration from the real world rather than from the imagination. Noteworthy is the concept of using ready made events. Here we understand that the position of observation is understood as an active, creative role.

Lawrence Weiner’s 1970 video entitled *Beached*⁵¹ provides a meditative example of an extrapolation of the ready made situation of flotsam washed up on shore. His use of the present continuous grammatical verb form provides us with a list of the individual actions in score like form. Whether as initial instruction for a performative piece or a manner of labeling a performance after its realization, this grammatical form embodies the on-going action of the piece and transcends a specific time and space through the indication of suspension of enactment.

Simultaneity

Kaprow continues with the idea of breaking up space and widening the distances between events. One is immediately reminded of Kaprow’s seminal work *18 Happenings in 6 Parts* which was reperformed as part of the *Move, Choreographing You* (2011) at the Royal Festival Hall, Southbank Centre, London. Rather than attempt to rigidly replicate the piece, Rosemary Butcher chose to work from the scores which Kaprow had left for the piece, for her an indication of the author’s intention to see the piece “reinvented.”

⁵⁰ Allan Kaprow. 1968. *How to Make a Happening*. (Vinyl). New York: Something Else Press. 12:25.

⁵¹ Lawrence Weiner. 1970. *Beached*. New York: Electronic Arts Intermix. 16:33.

Kaprow's piece is provocatively described in the text *Redoing "18 Happenings in 6 Parts,"* detailing André Lepecki's approach to what he calls *re-doing* the piece in 2006/2007.

Lepecki expresses his initial concern with the reenactment based on Kaprow's own aversion to the reperformance of happenings; a rule Kaprow later retracted. Lepecki discusses Kaprow's use of the words *act*, *part*, and *set* and how they are used interchangeably in Kaprow's original notes which seems to part from his proclamation against the use of established cultural forms. Although there is no floor plan for the piece, Lepecki wanted to re-do the space as true to the original as possible, basing the measurements for his re-design on photographs of the original piece. He contemplates and resolves the issue of Kaprow's inclusion of two clear references to the civil rights movement in the United States at the time of its performance which the author acknowledges. Societal connotations are taken into consideration for the re-doing of the piece.

There was knowledge of a quadraphonic sound system installed across the piece, but the vague sonic descriptions (such as *high pitched*, or *very compact*, or *jumble of words*) left much to interpretation which Lepecki grapples with through the use of recordings from the original performance. A real-time arrangement of playing the tapes as one would a musical instrument is created in order to achieve a dynamic sound environment.

Time-Space

Kaprow emphasizes real time and allows for events within a happening to take place at disjointed times. In doing so he is reiterating the blurring of art and life, extending not only the time frame of given cultural formats but expanding the physical boundaries of an experience to include vast quantities of time and space.

Kaprow breaks down the hierarchy of importance by stating that, "You don't have to be everywhere at once. You don't even have to be everywhere. The places you're in are as good as the places other participants are in." The concept of real time as opposed to unified time as it is used in the theatre is an important referential point that makes the happening as such immediately recognizable in its form which most resembles that of our everyday experiences. The flow of events within a happening are to take place in as natural and practical manner as possible so as to not waste time with organization.

Kaprow urges us to do what is convenient for the participants when constructing the events and their sequences. There is an adherence to societal rules, keeping in mind what it is that participants would do naturally rather than what the artist would like to see them do is particularly respectful of natural occurrence and experience.

Spontaneity

Kaprow's eighth rule is to "work with the powers around you, not against it, it makes things easier and you're interested in getting things done."⁵² He continues by endorsing the procurement of official permission and the involvement of police or political executives. This is an important statement which leads into his description of the importance of being your own public relations person. For Kaprow the emphasis is placed on play rather than on the provocative and attention grabbing divisive tool that the happening has become known for.

In rule number nine Kaprow states that a happening should never be rehearsed. He rattles off a list of actions which are imperfectible to emphasize the importance of laymanship in the realization of the happening. There is an allusion to the potential for the failure of a happening.

In rule ten, Kaprow states that the happening should only be performed once since doing it again creates the illusion that there is something to be improved on. Truly, reenactments tend to be scrutinized, particularly when a case can be made for the *correctness* of the interpretation. It is here that the criticism of a standardized art world reenters the scene of the performance or the happening.

Kaprow performs examples of happenings, using onomatopoeic words and candor. His genre is a literary one, his program notes for happenings which comprises the B-side of the LP is a series of freeform poems of intense visual, olfactory, sonic, and physical experience.

⁵² Allan Kaprow. *How to Make a Happening*. 8:53-9:03

II.2. The Event Score

Fluxus

During the 1960s, the event score became established as a compositional tool and artistic form. Germinating from the musical compositional practice of John Cage, openness as a characteristic of the musical score, blends into the realm of fine art, which follows a parallel trajectory. Event scores range from a single word indicating a singular action to complex scripts in which there are a series of linear or parallel actions, to fantastical or dreamlike instructions. They are all characterized by their reduction of action into a set of instructions, generally written in a self-effacing manner inviting participation / interpretation.

Given the poetic textual form of the event score, a visual typographic aesthetic was a natural progression in its development. Fluxus artists took the form of the event score and subjected it to rigorous scrutiny in terms of its composition, form, interpretation, and performance.

Both happenings and event scores developed simultaneously. Their primary protagonists, Allan Kaprow and George Brecht, studied with John Cage. In the first chapter of *Words to Be Looked At*, entitled *Post-Cagean Aesthetics and the Event Score*, Liz Kotz reveals the possible origins of the terms “event” and “happening.”

The era in which these artistic developments took place was turbulent and transitional. Both the happenings and event scores were radical in their refined method of observation culled from the quotidian and the ordinary. In essence it shed light on the notion of an artists’ self-importance and lured audiences out of the established institutions. Kotz moves in her book from “the use of words in musical notation to the form of the event score or performance instruction, to experimental poetry and the wide-ranging adoption of language as an instruction, schema, or template for works constructed in all types of media.”⁵³ In order to arrive at the reduction to essentials that event scores are characterized by, it was necessary to shift the artist’s role, expand the artists perception of themselves and the audience, rethink the methodology, and ultimately revise the execution of art.

The purely linguistic form of score in this cultural context had to, at first, free itself from the traditional musical score, in terms of notational and rhythmic structure. Doing so gave the score an

⁵³ Liz Koltz. 2007. *Words to be Looked At*. Cambridge: MIT Press. p. 4.

entirely new functionality. This new dimension saw the development of systems, both linguistic and visual, which blur the lines between music, art, and dance.

In potentia

John Cage's compositions in the 1950s based on chance operations and indeterminacy, and his experimental forms of composition brought him to his most well-cited work, 4'33". Here the musical composition is presented as a framework limited by time delineations. Cage abandons conventional musical syntax, removing it from the equation entirely, and replacing it with the sounds of the surrounding environment that are not predetermined through representation. The shift that occurs is from enactment to proposal for enactment. The score itself exists in several forms: written in grand staff notation with a 4//4 time signature, as a graphic score with durational indication, and as a typewritten text score. It moves from the notation of what is to be heard, through what is to be experienced, to what is to be done.

The form of event scores vary from very minimal instruction, to visual poetry and even situations which are only realizable as imaginary acts. Yoko Ono's dreamy scores, reminiscent of the way time is used in haiku poetry, are published in her book *Grapefruit*. Ono's event scores are a cross between poems and performances, the imagination functioning as the primary mode of interpretation considering their surreal implications.

Kotz traces Brecht's compositional approach via his mutual understanding with "Cage's interest in de-subjectivation and self-restraint."⁵⁴ She quotes fellow classmate Dick Higgins:⁵⁵ "Brecht picked up from Cagean understanding of his own love of complete anonymity, simplicity, and non-involvement with what he does."⁵⁶ This aspect is a defining quality of the event score; a trust that is given over to the interpreter of an event score based on a form of self-effacement. Before Brecht arrived at the eventual reduced form of his event scores he internalized the trajectory of Cage's curriculum, which referenced not only his own compositional methodology but "products of the scientific breakdown of sound properties into quantifiable spectra."⁵⁷

⁵⁴ Ibid., 66.

⁵⁵ Dick Higgins was an early Fluxus artist and is renowned for his early event scores and for having coined the word *Intermedia*.

⁵⁶ Ibid., 66.

quoting Higgins in Jefferson's *Birthday/Postface* (New York:Something Else Press, 1964 pg. 51).

⁵⁷ Liz Kotz. *Words to Be Looked At*. 68.

In *Noise Water Meat*, Douglas Kahn makes an important observation of Cage's "silencing" of the performer, a natural progression after the silencing of the audience, as a solo instance for what, in musical work, performers engage in all time: "Silence can be derived from the idleness of an instrument ... thus any sheet music or instrument becomes music *in potentia*, or the corpse of a music that has lived its life." Kahn states that the extension of musical silencing puts a process in motion that allows for the expansion of what could be considered a part of the musical domain.⁵⁸

Micro-macro

Electronic music made its debut on the international music scene, necessitating new forms of notation that were not restricted to tones arranged in a linear fashion. Duration in musical form has always gone hand-in-hand with technology. As technology grew, it became possible to store longer durations of music on a record and more common for people to own these recordings.

In conversation with Morton Feldman as part of the Radio Happenings series, John Cage reminds Feldman of how he, through his work *Projection*,⁵⁹ which he had composed on a piece of graph paper, "discovered a musical world that opened up everything." The piece gave the interpreter the choice of playing in the high, middle, or low range. At this moment, Cage states, the musical world changed from having been about the musical world that was outside of you to being about the musical world that is both outside of you and inside of you.⁶⁰ Later in the conversation Cage weighs in on the role that radios play in "making available to your ears, what was already in the air and available to your ears but you couldn't hear," reminding Feldman that people are constantly bathed in radio and television waves, not to mention waves of telepathic thought.⁶¹ The conversation is focused around the notion of being "deep in thought" and the shift to being "deep in thought constantly interrupted." Cage offers this as a way to think of being a composer; as someone deep in thought who is constantly interrupted or, as he himself has suggested through his own work, someone who doesn't have any thoughts at all and thus can neither be said to be shallow or deep; one who simply sets something going, that either has sounds in it or doesn't have sounds in it,

⁵⁸ Douglas Kahn. 2001. *Noise Water Meat*. Cambridge: MIT. p. 166.

⁵⁹ Morton Feldman invented a new form of notation through his composition of the Projections series from 1950-51. These are renowned as the first examples of graphically scored works of the postwar era.

Brett Boutwell. 2012. *Morton Feldman's Graphic Notation: Projections and Trajectories*. In *Journal of the Society for American Music*, 6(4), 457-482. Abstract.

⁶⁰ John Cage and Morton Feldman, 1966-1967. *Radio Happening I-V*. New York: WBAI. 10:30-12:30.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, 13:50-14:10.

some things that enables not only himself but others to have an experience. For him it goes “out of thought into experience.”⁶²

The WDR Electronic Music Studio in Cologne, served as a springboard for a pivotal and radical leap in compositional methodology. The emergence of electroacoustic instruments, the exploration of technologies both analogue and digital, and the development of the concept of the interface all necessitated a shift in forms of musical or sound notation and expanded the notion of how and what we hear, and the conception of composition as a tool to mirror or embody the experience of sound. Works that explored the concept of duration and especially duration as a single event were explorations of the platform provided by technological advancements in electroacoustic music.

Karlheinz Stockhausen talks about the parallels between his and his contemporaries’ mode of composition and how reduction to the smallest possible element was being researched in various fields both scientific and artistic at the time. He goes on to describe the process of formation, in the sense of crystalizing the result of a creative act, the form being just an instant in a process, and the notion of things not being in time but time occurring within the things. The move from the concept of objective astronomical time toward the concept of biological or organic time is emphasized. Stockhausen describes how by working systematically with a single note, the birth of electronic music took place through the synthesis of timbre in order to create a unified musical structure and to find a coherent system to derive the macro from the micro and vice-versa.⁶³

II.3. The Manifesto

Tender Revolutionaries

The manifesto is a philosophical and theoretical framework within which deeds or experiments can be and are performed in support of its proclamations. It provides a platform that is radical in how it instates itself at the moment of its presentation, distribution, or publication, as its incubation having taken place prior to its formulation. When the avant-garde manifesto is written, there is already a body of work that represents what is being proclaimed. What is being proclaimed is a message intrinsic to, or at the very least carried by the works that are made in its name, including those preceding its actual utterance. In addition, the manifesto serves as a call to action, an invitation to

⁶² Ibid., 22:00-23:15.

⁶³ Karlheinz Stockhausen. 1972. *Lecture 1: Musical Forming*. London: Institute of Contemporary Arts. 6:47-10:39.

join a movement with the potential to initiate change. As with the political manifesto, the art manifesto is meant to cause a fracture or fissure through its representation of a communal body which speaks in the first-person plural; “we.”

The manifesto is a transdisciplinary device. In his publication, *Poetry of the Revolution: Marx, Manifestos and the Avant-Gardes*. Martin Puchner divides the history of manifesto into three phases: first, the emergence of the manifesto as a recognizable political genre in the mid-nineteenth century (*The Communist Manifesto*, 1848); second, the creation of avant-garde movements through the explosion of the art manifesto in the early twentieth century (*Futurist Manifesto*, c.1909); and third, the rivalry between the socialist manifesto and the avant-garde manifesto from the 1910s to the late 1960s. Over time, this antagonism lost its force, settling into pockets of localized, geographically specific, and institutional resistance. In the beginning, the art manifesto did not “merely register art’s political ambitions,” it changed the “very nature” of the art work itself.

Before it was published in *Le Figaro* in France, the *Futurist Manifesto* had a chance to find its bearings throughout Italy. Its international printing is a moment of acknowledgment on the time scale of its conception, application, manifestation, extrapolation and eventual diffusion. The history of the avant-garde manifesto sees a feeding of one upon another, each manifesto building upon the revelations and shifts accomplished by its predecessor. In most instances we are left with the legacy and a shift, a reference, a point of departure that draws an indelible line between before and after. The Futurist Manifesto’s endowment, resulting from its wake-up call ringing in a new brand of civilization, is the freeing of the text from its traditional role on the page.

In a backlash against the bourgeoisie and nationalism that was understood to have preempted WWI, the Dada movement strove to change the world by putting “deeds above ideas.”⁶⁴ Maftei Ștefan-Sebastian traces the societal concerns reflected in the Dadaist movement by focusing on Hugo Ball’s initial preoccupation with anarchist philosophy and his eventual distancing of himself from radical anarchism as he turned “towards pacifist anarchism, where the anarchist becomes the “brainworker,” the *Kopfarbeiter*, a creator of new life through new forms of art.”⁶⁵ Hugo Ball’s shift from active anarchist enables him to move from political dogma toward a cultural doctrine with a utopian flair striving toward liberty but removing political ambition from the equation.

⁶⁴ Eli Anapur. 2016. *DADA Manifesto Explained – Hugo Ball versus Tristan Tzara*.

⁶⁵ Maftei Ștefan-Sebastian, M. *A Cultural Revolution for the “Free Spirits:” Hugo Ball’s Nietzschean Anarchism*. p. 69.

The Dada manifesto emerged less than a decade after the first of the many Futurist manifestos; subsequent manifestos⁶⁶ included Luigi Russolo's renowned *The Art of Noises*, the *Futurist Manifesto of Lust* by Valentine de Saint-Point, and Marinetti's own "Destruction of Syntax—Imagination without Strings—Words-in-Freedom." The foundation for an entire aesthetic program was laid out for everything from painting, sculpture, architecture, music, and cinema to *The Futurist Reconstruction of the Universe*.⁶⁷ While Russian Futurist artists and poets were breaking new ground by exploiting the liberation of the word, Tristan Tzara was relocating to neutral Switzerland after tumultuous political experiences in his native Romania. He started Dada's second anti-establishment, anti-aggressive manifesto, with a formula for a manifesto: "In order to launch a manifesto, you have to demand: A. B. & C., and denounce 1, 2, & 3." He continued: "I write a manifesto and I don't want anything, nevertheless I say several things and I am against manifestos on principle just as I am against principles."⁶⁸

The freedom to want freedom from whatever framework or structure is suppressing expression is a key impetus in the formation of the manifesto. Dada used the absurd to break through the confines of logic, reason and aestheticism; Yvonne Rainer's *No Manifesto* (1965) sought to challenge historical clichés through the exploration of general movement.

The Mind Is the Muscle⁶⁹

Dancer and choreographer Yvonne Rainer describes her work as "having an argument with everything that has come before." Her *No Manifesto* challenges the historical development of dance and choreography. Her strategy was to demystify dance by suggesting an alternative aesthetic paradigm and employing a style of performance that draws on quotidian movement and expression, or rather the lack thereof. Here the manifesto is aflame with its power to proclaim, and claim, relevance.

⁶⁶ Marinetti's manifesto was a catalyst for expression. Over fifty additional manifestos by the Futurists alone ensued within the scope of several years, many of them authored by Marinetti himself.

Alex Danchev. (Ed.). *100 Artists' Manifestos: From the Futurists to the Stuckists*. 1.

⁶⁷ Giacomo Balla and Fortunato Depero. 2018. *The Futurist Reconstruction of the Universe*. (Recording: Read by Joshua Mehigan). New York: MoMA Talks: Performances and Readings.

⁶⁸ Julia Peyton-Jones and Ulrich Obrist, H. (Eds.). *Serpentine Gallery Manifesto Marathon*. 27.

⁶⁹ *The Mind is the Muscle* is the title of one of Yvonne Rainer's seminal choreographed works and the title of a book by Catherine Wood which examines the political and media context of Rainer's formulation of new kinds of "social scripts." (Catherine Wood. 2007. *The Mind is a Muscle*. London: Afterall Books.)

Rainer's *No Manifesto* reads as instruction providing a certain set of boundaries within which to create, a restraint mechanism to prevent getting carried away or intoxicated by spectacle and virtuosity, and to prevent the seduction of the spectator. Through her statement, she radically opposes a tradition in dance that her work stood so radically in opposition to.

A manifesto implies a radical, at times violent, break with whichever reigning party or archetype is being broken away from. Such a manifesto is characterized by its consensus of commonality and of its "being against." Rainer's imperative, reductive style implies a no less clear delineation. Her explanation, however, clarifies that her words were meant as a way to create pathways into and around various forms of practice, both classical and avant-garde, the latter of which was in need of acknowledgement. The "reduction to essentials" reflected in Rainer's manifesto mirrors her exploration of the removal of objects and inflections from dance through her *practice*; this exploration culminated in a piece entitled *Trio A* (1966). A new direction is revealed through the piece for what dance can encompass in terms of movement and presence, as well as in terms of the bodies that are permitted to participate in it.

According to Rainer, *Trio A* is the only work of hers that has been documented in its entirety. The work existed as a photographic series and was later filmed on 16mm film. The piece has also been transcribed into the Labanotation system, a graphic system of symbols used to create a precise movement score or script which can be read/interpreted quite strictly. The film has provided greater access to the dance's overall qualities, especially after it was digitized, and it has served as instruction for future performances of the piece that did not have Rainer's guidance, her preferred method for the transmission of the work. *Trio A*, its performance and form maintained through instruction, film, photographs, and Rainer's teaching, and more importantly the message of bodily awareness encoded within the work and its transmission through both audience and performer.

Trio A has attained legendary status and as such has seen many reperformances. This raises familiar questions around reperforming, concerning memory, disappearance, documentation, and authenticity. It also alludes to transmission through memory, physical memory, and "muscle memory."

Art Theory and Practice as Manifesto

The Serpentine Gallery's *Manifesto Marathon* included much criticism of the relevance of the manifesto as a form. It was proclaimed as outdated, retrograde, ineffective in terms of its tone and demonstrative nature, violent and proclamatory. What has become clear after reading several of the manifestos, often written from a first-person singular perspective rather than the first-person plural, is that the manifesto is first and foremost a literary genre and platform that is forever bound to its performative essence, through its presentation, its distribution, or its enactment through actions that are in line with its codex.

The idea of reclaiming the format of the manifesto as a means of reassessment and reconciliation coincides with Tino Sehgal's contribution – a conversation – to the *Manifesto Marathon*. Sehgal, whose constructed situations are achieved as actions performed through sets of instructions, declared that the masculine declarative tone of confidence and vulgarity that was symptomatic of the twentieth century is no longer viable. Sehgal suggested that it makes more sense to engage and extrapolate by embracing an aristocratic ethos of self-cultivation, rather than to oppose in a manner he describes as vulgar, from the position of an outsider on the fringes of society. Sehgal's sentiments on ubiquitous commodification coincide with Peter Lamborn Wilson's notion of everything having been mapped geologically, making the existence of a pirate utopia no longer viable.

In his contribution to the Serpentine *Manifesto Marathon*, Nicolas Bourriaud proclaimed that post-modernism had come to an end, declaring the closure of an era of art creation, at least from the point of view of what is contemporary. His proclamation at the marathon called for a modernity of the present, an alter-modernity which will rise out of planetary negotiations from diverse cultures. He based his predictions on the function of language, or rather the translation of language, and the universality of subtitling, the marriage of text and image.⁷⁰ Bourriaud's practice and his verdict on the future of art appears to fit well into the genre of the manifesto.

⁷⁰ Serpentine Galleries. 2016. *Manifesto Marathon 2008: Nicolas Bourriaud*. 6:02.

1+1=3

Peter Lamborn Wilson's thesis on Temporary Autonomous Zones (TAZ) is written in the first-person plural as the *Association for Ontological Anarchy*, Wilson does not lay claim to the phenomenon as such, but states that this is not something he invented, just something he noticed and gave a clever name to which escaped from his grasp and now appears in the world as a phrase.⁷¹ "We have no desire to define the TAZ or to elaborate dogmas about how it must be created. Our contention is rather that it has been created, will be created, and is being created."⁷²

Wilson goes on to provide descriptive accounts dating back, "arbitrarily" to the sixteenth and seventeenth century and the settlement of the New World.⁷³ The TAZ is described as a physical place in time. The emphasis is on a physical place, creating a clear case against a virtual community qualifying as a TAZ. Internet as a medium may provide a platform for communication that will enable a TAZ to come into being, but a physical presence is one of its indivisible components.

The exalted state or "high spirit" which brings about a TAZ is difficult to sustain. In Wilson's observation it generally last from approximately eighteen months to two years, which seems to be a natural algorithm for the rise and eventual dissipation of a TAZ. Exceptions are communities that draw less attention to themselves or those that are transformed from a TAZ into an institution. Wilson makes a case for the creation or preparation of certain conditions that contribute to the occurrence of spontaneity, the groundwork and fertilization of the TAZ.

Wilson's position revels in revolution and resistance that takes place off the public stage, the waxing and waning of reactions that occur within the complex landscape of relationality and interpretation of liberties. Wilson presents the container or frame of the manifesto as manifesto itself in a descriptive analysis and proposed tool for the sustainment of resistant strains.

⁷¹ Luc Sala. 2007. *Hakim Bey -Peter Lamborn Wilson*. (Interview). 1:40-1:55.

⁷² Hakim Bey. 1985. *TAZ: The Temporary Autonomous Zone, Ontological Anarchy, Poetic Terrorism*. The Anarchist Libraray. p. 106.

⁷³ Luc Sala. 2007. *Hakim Bey -Peter Lamborn Wilson*. 2:10-2:25.

Shapeshifting

In the realm of the arts, manifesto making and game-changing has become so entwined with institution that it is difficult to frame a transition within the terms of a grassroots manifesto. Its form is rather that of theory and speculation, curatorial practice and artist/art group strategy.

Perhaps the hashtag, employing an absolute verbal frugality, functions as minimalist manifesto. The hashtag is a pamphlet, a soapbox and a proclamation nailed to the chapel door. The focus shifts from the “we” into the “I-as-we” in terms of how “I” relate, “I” reiterate, “I” interpret, and how, through personal cultivation and action, “we” revolt, “we” participate. #occupywallstreet, #resist, #blacklivesmatter, and #metoo are a few examples of the social and political activism that place faith in good old-fashion revolution and #TheResistance.⁷⁴

Manifesto Machine

Text-based performer and research-based installation artist Falke Pisano participated in the Manifesto Marathon with her text entitled Manifesto Machine. She deconstructs the manifesto machine into two parts. The first part is concerned with doubling and the second part is concerned with multiplicity and singularity. The first part is a list of things that exist as polarities, things divided, both formal and conceptual. The following things are doubled: “the Manifesto itself, Time, Space, Form, Individuation, the Body, Articulations, Statements, and Performativity.” The second part, “the subjective navigation of Part One” entitled I HERE NOW deals with the multiplicity of the “I” which transforms the specific singular notion of the “I” into a machine.

The Gentle Barbarian

Boudník’s post-war experience of suffering and poverty was a central theme in his underlying aesthetic theory.⁷⁵ Reminiscent of graphic scores, Boudník’s structural graphic prints were produced using material procured from what he used daily at the factory where he was employed. His initial peace manifestos as well as his *Explosionalism* manifestos were produced as lithographic etchings.

⁷⁴ Hashtag for the The Resistance Party, a grassroots movement fighting against the American radical right. See www.theresistanceparty.org.

⁷⁵ Vladmír Boudník was sent to a forced labor camp in Dortmund in 1943. He survived several bombings of the city.

Overall, he composed five numbered manifestos and several unnumbered manifestos in which he detailed his experiences and made proposals for contemporary society. Taking to the street, Boudník created over two hundred “street events and improvised lectures” teaching random people using the structures of Prague’s decaying walls to illustrate his concept of “creation based on thinking associations, the ability to recall based on various locations, perceptions and life experiences, and concrete shapes and contexts” which would in turn “change one’s perception and points of view.”⁷⁶ His texts are written for the most part in the second-person singular, as if in direct communication with an individual reader. Boudník’s *Explosionalism* was a self-proclaimed movement with a single charismatic protagonist.

Boudník distributed hundreds of letters and *Explosionalism* manifestos detailing his artistic movements and efforts. He created his *Explosionalism Edition Series* self-publishing story-reportages and critical reviews in editions of four or five copies each. Self-cultivation is central to Boudník’s *Explosionalism*, as is the conviction that the border between author-audience can be erased through creative thought, allowing the viewer to become a part of the work.

II.4. Reduction to Essentials

Haiku

The poetic form of haiku has been embraced in many languages because of its structural and conceptual principles. The universal nature of a haiku’s message is formed through the distillation of experience based on careful observation. The haiku carries within itself a sense of wonder, an understated excitement, and timelessness. According to Antonín Líman in *Temple Full of Blossoms*, a haiku is primarily a “spiritual search,” one of “revelation and realization,” and the “record of experience.” The experience that Líman is referencing is described in the same vein as Gadamer’s concept of individual experience in terms of its relationship to the whole.

Líman traces the origin of the Japanese haiku to the *tanka* and *waka*,⁷⁷ forms of poetry that were, “of primary interest as the most appropriate means for a concise expression of depth and

⁷⁶ Accompanying texts for the exhibition Vladimír Boudník at the City of Prague Museum. (28 June – 19 November 2017).

⁷⁷ *Waka* encompasses several poetic forms. Of these the *tanka* is the most widely composed type. The category being derived from the differentiation between long form and short form poetry in the latter half of the eighth century AD is similar to haiku in that it has a set number of lines and syllables. It uses simile, metaphor, and personification, and is often concerned with nature, seasons, love, sadness and other strong emotions. It takes the form of 5-7-5-7-7.

unrepeatability of the instance of an experience.” In such forms, the attempt is to “empathize with the essence of things” and to “[share] something deeper than the meaning of individual words used in a poem, while expressing foremost the aesthetic principles of *aware*⁷⁸ and *jodzo*,⁷⁹ to which Heian poets adhered.”⁸⁰ Both of these concepts are united in the term *yūgen*, which expresses “that which lies beyond what can be said.”⁸¹ This, however, is not understood as a reference to another world; it is concerned with this world and this experience.

Interiority

Kōjin Karatani traces the reform of Japanese writing through the *genbun itchi*⁸² movement, educational reform, and the adoption of colloquial language. He states that “the issue here is not the actual abandonment of Chinese writing but rather a profound undermining of the privileged status of writing (as *kanji*),⁸³ which was accomplished through advocating an ideology of phonetic speech.”⁸⁴ Karatani links the *genbun itchi* movement to the Japanese discovery of realism and interiority by tracing the use of make-up and spectacle in theater. Karatani states that the “face as concept” could be grasped sensuously, similarly to the satisfaction obtained from “landscape as concept.” The “discovery” here is that of the naked face as a kind of landscape in which an inversion takes place, away from the ornamentation and the privilege of conception towards the face or landscape taking on meaning “in and of itself.” The process is one of transformation from “what had been insignificant” into something “profoundly significant.”⁸⁵

Masaoka Shiki was one of the most vociferous opponents of imperial poetry and its depictions using the signified and allegorical rather than the existing. Shiki was a proponent of the realism that was predominant in Western literature. The contemporary forms of haiku and tanka are largely due to his reforms legitimizing the haiku as a literary genre. Karatani quotes Kyoshi Takahama from his

⁷⁸ The term *mono no aware* translates literally as “the pathos of things,” “an empathy toward things,” “sensitivity to ephemera,” or the “ahh-ness of things” and is the Japanese term for “the awareness of impermanence” or “the transience of things.” It is central to philology of literature and cultural tradition in Japan.

Wikipedia, s.v. *Hmono no aware*.

⁷⁹ *Jodzo* (Líman’s phonetic Czech spelling) expresses the prerequisite for a poem to contain meaning other than those merely implied by the words used.

⁸⁰ Antonín Líman. *Chrám plný květů*. 306-307.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, 307.

⁸² Modern Japanese writing system.

⁸³ Chinese writing system.

⁸⁴ Karatani Kōjin. 1993. *Origins of Modern Japanese Literature*. Durham and London: Duke University Press. p. 51.

⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, 56.

essay “The Origins and Significance of Sketching,” in which Takahama describes the phenomenon of “sketching” literature, breaking with traditional formats.

Karatani traces interiority as being profoundly linked with modern science. Through the discoveries of Copernicus and Galileo (analytic geometry), experiential actuality along with perception is rendered irrelevant. Here the mathematical world substitutes for the experienced and experienceable.⁸⁶ Shiki and Takahama in their field work “sketch” and document “acting as true scientists.” Karatani continues by stating that “a certain kind of inversion was already latent in their obsession with documentation, the inversion that produced the notion of a transcendental interiority. They were not themselves ‘inward personalities,’ but their practices established a basis for interiority.”⁸⁷ The question of the prototypical manifestation of interiority as expressed in literature is examined within the third decade of the Meiji when *genbu itchi* had become established. The discovery of landscapes outside of those with historical or literary connotations has been attributed to a literary work by Doppo Kunikida entitled *The Musashi Plain* (1898) in which humanity and nature are intertwined. “To discover landscape also meant to discover history.”⁸⁸

The concept of “sketching literature” is analogous to the present progressive verb form in English and features overt narration. Here the narrator is present on a meta-level of the text. Shiki discovered a kind of realism in the haiku in which everything is sketched in a language combining elegant diction, vulgar diction, and Chinese words all used as deemed necessary. Here, the importance of language and its diversity takes precedence over sketching as a concept. It’s interesting to note that the idea of sketching in literature is a turn toward realism.

Within the context of significant social changes at the beginning of the *Tokugawa shogunate*⁸⁹ (1603-1867), a marked shift took place in the use of poetic language. While the original *renga* was poetry of the upper classes and demanded the preservation of medieval aesthetics and the use of classical language emanating from tanka poetry, *haikai no renga*⁹⁰ also allowed for the use of the

⁸⁶ Ibid., 63.

⁸⁷ Ibid., 65.

⁸⁸ Ibid., 66-67.

⁸⁹ *Tokugawa shogunate* was the last feudal Japanese military government (1600-1868) and the final era of traditional Japanese government; also known as the Tokugawa, Edo or pre-modern Period.

⁹⁰ Philosopher Watsuji Tetsurō in *A Study of the History of the Japanese Spirit* uses *renga* poetry as an analogy of the tension that is necessary to maintain between “one’s individual and one’s social nature,” which if released would cause one to overwhelm the other. *Renga* poems are not created by a single individual but by a group of poets, with each individual verse linked to the next, and each verse the creation of a single individual, and yet each must cohere with the “poetic sphere” as a whole.

Robert Carter and Erin McCarthy. Spring 2017 Edition. *Watsuji Tetsurō*. Edward N. Zalta (Ed.). The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy.

vernacular.⁹¹ The poet Matsuo Bashō (1644-1694) may have initially continued in the traditional style, creating plays on words; later, however, he began to bring severity and a philosophical undertone to the haiku through the expression of a new poetic prerequisite: according to Bashō, a good poem must contain honestly honed or elaborated verses (*shiori*, meaning “lightness, malleability”) – as opposed to ostentatious affection – and be filled with empathy for the tiniest shades and connotations of the emerging verse (*hosomi*, meaning “slenderness, sparsity”). Bashō later added another prerequisite: lightness (*karumi*), through which the poet is able to add affective beauty as well as an image of ordinary, everyday reality.⁹²

Wabi-sabi

Sen no Rikjū, known as the father of the tea ceremony, had a definitive influence on Bashō’s aesthetic principles. Rikjū employed the aesthetic principles of *wabi* and *sabi* in his tea practice. These principles have become guiding principles in the practice of writing haiku.⁹³ The concept of *wabi-sabi* refers to the beauty of the imperfect, the impermanent, and the melancholy and expresses respect for fragility and modesty. It is a combination of the words *wabi* (originally from the word *wabu* meaning to be wretched and referring to the miserable feeling that comes from material deprivation, later developing the meaning of the bittersweet melancholy of solitude in nature) and *sabi* (loneliness, leanness, or withered-ness, later developing into showing marks of aging or wear that can enhance) and is linked to the Buddhist ideas of being at peace with transience and imperfection.

Zen-trained tea master Sen no Rikyū was commissioned by the warlord Hideyoshi Toyotomi to redesign the tea ceremony as a way to foster peace and to unite a recently divided feudal Japan in the late sixteenth century. Rikyū stripped the non-essential elements from the tea ceremony and codified its movements, creating a practical, graceful, and minimal choreography with the essence of wabi-sabi nestled in the core of the ritual.

⁹¹ Antonín Líman. *Chrám plný květů*. 310.

⁹² *Ibid.*, 312-313.

⁹³ *Ibid.*, 313.

8-8-8

Richard Gilbert and Judy Yoneoka make a case for an 8-8-8 structure, rather than the traditionally understood 5-7-5 structure, through an in-depth study into the reading and rhythm that is implicit in haiku and natural in Japanese. Their study also investigates the application of the poetic form of the haiku that has taken root, not merely in the English language, a phenomenon which they trace back to Ezra Pound, a member of the imagists and advocate of the free-verse movement in poetry.

Gilbert and Yoneoka present William J. Higginson's English language guidelines for the writing of traditional Japanese haiku as published in *The Haiku Handbook* (1985). Higginson presents these guidelines as corresponding to the English language poetic tradition and to the amount of information that the traditional haiku is concerned with, as well as its quantities and rhythmical proportions. Various modes of emulation are discussed in terms of the form that modern haiku have taken rather than as a critique of the adaptation of various interpretations of syllable count and line breaks. Through the practical application of a theory of metrical phonology to haiku and its recitation, the authors propose a 24-mora⁹⁴ template as the guiding compositional principle behind haiku. The significance of this interpretation is the underlying concept of meter rather than form in the creation of a haiku. There are many examples of traditional haiku that do not adhere to a rigid seventeen-syllable form.

Another important element of the traditional haiku is the seasonal word (*kigo*) or seasonal topic (*kidai*), which incorporate recurring events that are part of natural cycles. These are specified and expressed in their barest minimal form as concrete imagery. They generally indicate a complete season, but may also be as specific as early spring, late autumn, or mid-winter.⁹⁵ The language is spare, yet it resonates with the depth and mystery of the natural world, lending the haiku an allegorical quality that can be pinned to a particular time. Rather than employing metaphor to convey meaning, an instant is related to a universal principle.

The haiku exploits the vernacular for its relationship to the commonplace while avoiding the ordinary. It is concerned with a fresh perception and sudden awareness of the commonality of human experience. Rather than explain, the haiku reveals, in the barest possible terms and imagery,

⁹⁴ *Mora* is a linguistic term used to identify the sense of 'phonic time-units' or 'time-lengths' in Japanese speech. *Mora*, and *morae*, its plural, are English linguistics terms and also Japanese loanwords. It is the unit of time equivalent to the ordinary or normal short sound or syllable.

⁹⁵ Bruce Ross. *The Essence of Haiku*.

an ongoing event frozen in a moment of becoming, a completely self-sustained and self-contained epiphany. The event is enveloped and imbued with historical significance through the application of an open form that requires the comprehension of its underlying principles and an intuitive sense of its metric form.

II.5. Becoming Actual

Reperformance

In order to examine how historical performance art has served as score two examples are used; *Seven Easy Pieces* by Marina Abramović (2005) and *Replaced* by Barbora Klímová (2006). These works utilize reperformance in significantly divergent ways.

Marina Abramović's curatorial concept for the Guggenheim Museum⁹⁶ was to reperform six iconic works of performance art, and to create a seventh, new performance piece. Originality and authenticity had long been associated with the genre of performance art, making reperformance a bold prospect. Abramović's choice to do so was partially based on her own and others' works in popular culture she felt had not been given the credit and acknowledgement that she thought they deserved. The reperformance served dual, perhaps contrary, purposes; the distillation of a performance score from the works, and simultaneously, the canonization of each piece itself as performed by her. Abramović's inquiry looks very specifically at reperformance through the optics of cultural heritage. Abramović affirms herself as an authority and seeks permission from the original authors or from the heads of their estates to reperform the pieces.

The pieces Barbora Klímová chose were originally performed in communist Czechoslovakia in the 1970s and 80s and are chosen for their non-conflictual nature and placement in public space. They serve as a subsequent comparative research tool.

The particularities of the interpretation and their use as a tool for social inquiry, is particular to the way in which Klímová presents her work to the public. Here, her interpretation is secondary and is more of an ambient backdrop to the scrutiny of these authors' intent and the social and political environment that formed and defined them. She also looks at the process of reperforming itself,

⁹⁶ Solomon R. Guggenheim Museum. 2005. *Marina Abramović: Seven Easy Pieces*.

particularly through having chosen the method of interviewing the performers about the performances rather than having relied on documentation alone.

In the case of *Seven Easy Pieces*, the behind the scenes stories are a sort of folklore associated with the work and told in anecdotes, whereas interviews with the artists concerning their original works are an integral part of the Replaced project and of their reperformance, which Klímová refers to as “*replacements*” through her title.

To this end, the visual and aesthetic quality of each replacement is secondary to Klímová’s personal experience of the work. Little importance is placed on the locality or the replication of the qualities of the original physical locations. Due to the fact that very little documentation of the original performances exists, Klímová was afforded a wide field for their interpretation.

Abramovic’s endeavor is the result of a lifelong process and validation of her performance work and the development of a working method⁹⁷ characterized by the notion of being present in both time and space. Each of the pieces which were reperformed lasted seven hours and took place over the course of one week. Abramovič is renowned for her durational pieces, which require physical resilience and mental concentration and focus. In juxtaposing the pieces as such, she creates a glossary of performance pieces and reveals through each remaking the substance of her own practice. Abramović is charismatic and extravagant in how she describes her work. Her lifelong work is to be understood as a manifesto designed to reach far into the fabric of the individual and society.

An integral part of Klímová’s work were transcripts of the interviews she conducted with the authors of the original works she reperformed, or rather reexperienced. Each of her interviews brings us closer to understanding the atmosphere of the period, and environment in which the works were created, as well as the personality of each of the artists turned protagonists in her project.

As a research-based project, Replaced requires a different type of personal investment than the original performances which took place in intimate settings either witnessed by a handful of invited guests or, in the sense of Kaprow’s *Happening*, in an inconspicuous manner in public space, more in the sense of Kaprow’s *Happening*. Less is left up to the imagination in Klímová’s project; the

⁹⁷ Marina Abramovic. 2018. *The Abramovic Method*.

performative works are subjected to an analytical scrutiny which takes place without the formation of a subjective opinion. That she leaves to the audience.

The function of this transference takes place in a manner distinctly contrasting to that which Abramović employs in order to touch or reach her audience. The extent of the perpetuation of the mythology both of the artist and their oeuvre, either through their own ambition or the institutional support thereof, must be considered when contemplating what it is the reperformance accomplishes. In *Seven Easy Pieces*, the works that are replicated were not unknown within an international context. Klimová's reperformances also take place within an established and prestigious institutional framework, that of the Jindrich Chalupecky Award, however, there is a humble almost self-effacing aura to the work which moves it into an area of interdisciplinarity which plays less with the concept of the "here and now"⁹⁸ than Abramović does in *Seven Easy Pieces*.

Presence

Amelia Jones makes a case against performance art's claim to presence in her essay "The Artist is Present": *Artistic Re-enactments and the Impossibility of Presence*. Her aim is to bring light to "the dilemma of performance histories and what is possible to know about live art."⁹⁹

An attempt to tackle the subject of the documentation of "live art" in Czechoslovakia took place in 2012 at the *Dokumentace Umění* conference at the Faculty of Art and Design at Jan Evangelista Purkyně University in Ústí nad Labem. The editors addressed a generation of artists whose performance work spans a period when accessibility to a means of documentation (from the 1960s through the 1980s) were limited. One of the impulses to hold the conference was the attention that had been given to the documentation of live art over the previous decade by established international venues, for example, the Tate Modern's *Collecting the Performative* project.¹⁰⁰ Within seven essays and transcripts of ensuing discussions, the issue of documentation is investigated along with its characteristics and parameters, its contextuality and its usage for exhibition and publication.

⁹⁸ "Here and now" is a term often referenced when describing the experience of performative work by the viewer, when a feeling of the suspension of time is evoked or rather the awareness of a delineated experience within which the viewer resides for the duration of the piece.

⁹⁹ Amelia Jones. 2011. "The Artist is Present": *Artistic Re-enactments and the Impossibility of Presence*. In *TDR: The Drama Review*. (55/1, Spring 2011). Cambridge: The MIT Press. p. 18.

¹⁰⁰ Pip Laurenson. 2014. *Collecting the Performative*. London: Tate Modern (Research Network).

By using the examples of *Seven Easy Pieces* and *Replaced*, particular factors, working methods, creative and decision-making processes which are symptomatic for reperformance are revealed. Documentation, archived material, eye-witness accounts, and conversations with the work's original author serve as source material, all of which are the subject of historical and contextual interpretation. The esprit d'epoch captured through documentation and through the passing down of information through generations, influences the aesthetic character of the work and its reperformance. Its presentation within an institutional framework (or lack thereof) plays an important (if not decisive) role in the reception of the interpretation by the public at large and by accepted authorities in the given field, in this particular case, fine art and performance.

II.6. Exploiting the Quotidian

Reenactment and Socially Engaged Art

Visual and performance artist Pablo Helguera uses participation, archiving, discussions, happenings, and civic ceremonies in his work and pedagogy. In *Education for Socially Engaged Art*, multi-layered participatory structures are described, broken down into several areas, namely: nominal participation, directed participation, creative participation, and collaborative participation. While nominal and directed participation are generally defined by a single encounter, creative and collaborative participation are developed over a significant period of time, anywhere from a day to several years. These areas differ in the range of possible goals and outcomes, degree of participation, and ultimately the evaluation of community experience. Socially engaged practice in the arts can be characterized by voluntary (willing submission), non-voluntary (non-consensual), and involuntary (inadvertently involved) forms of participation.¹⁰¹ In order to escape mere spectacle in performative practice, Helguera stresses the importance of play and awareness of the “performative function in social interactions.”¹⁰² It is through the disruption of existing social values that space is created for critical reflection. Helguera goes on to explain that what occurs through this disruption of social roles is an inversion and ultimately a merging of meaning and interpretation, either annulling the roles or linking them in ways that conventional disciplines may be hesitant to.

¹⁰¹ Pablo Helguera. 2011. *Education for Socially Engaged Art*. Mexico City: Jorge Pinto Books. p. 61.

¹⁰² Ibid., 70.

The Battle of the Oranges takes place each year in the Northern Italian city of Ivrea. The battling tradition of throwing oranges is historically linked to the lore of the city's defiance against a ruling tyrant. Horse drawn wagons move from district to district where battles are waged by aggressively launching oranges at one another.¹⁰³

The Battle of Wyoming (Wyoming Massacre)¹⁰⁴ is a Revolutionary War Battle which was reenacted in 2011 and 2014 by the 24th Connecticut Militia Regiment¹⁰⁵ and the 42nd Regiment of Foot, both of which are non-profit volunteer organizations. All of the participants are volunteers who equip, dress and arm themselves at their own expense, taking great pains to replicate the attire and manner of the units they represent.¹⁰⁶

The festival, however differing from historical reenactment, maintains a similar characteristic in terms of the rhythm and existing template of experience. Gadamer looks at festivals in terms of their temporal structure and repetition. In its repetition it is neither the festival itself nor a remembrance of that festival that was originally celebrated. "The originally sacral character of all festivals obviously excludes the familiar distinction in time experience between present, memory, and expectation. The time experience of the festival is rather its *celebration*, a present time sui generis."¹⁰⁷ In the example of the Battle of the Oranges we see how the celebration has become a festival of sorts, where the legend is a component, however the manifestation has taken on a life of its own, somewhere between reverie, ecstasy, and extraordinariness.

Contemporaneity

The concept of *contemporaneity* is well illustrated through the example of reenactment. An historic event is propelled into the present through bridging historical witnessing and contemporary experience. Through direct presence the imagined event is brought into real-time, challenging the subject/audience with the offer of coupling recollection with expectancy. Gadamer prescribes *contemporaneity* to the work of art, in that it is the "essence of being present." It is the concept of "full presence" which is achieved through the presentation of a particular thing regardless of the measure of time which delineates us from the original event. Rather than a given, it is an

¹⁰³ See Storico Carnevale di Ivrea.

¹⁰⁴ [FarNorthUSA]. 2011. *Revolutionary War reenactment-Pennsylvania*. Amateur live footage from the reenactment.

¹⁰⁵ See *The 24th Connecticut Militia Regiment* website.

¹⁰⁶ See the *Battle of Wyoming* website.

¹⁰⁷ Hans-Georg Gadamer. 2013. *Truth and Method*. London and New York: Bloomsbury Academic. p. 126.

undertaking of the consciousness toward an accomplishment, an appeal to supersede mediation “in total presence.” *Contemporaneity* is perceptible in religious ritual which Gadamer refers to when describing “being present” through “genuine participation in the redemptive event itself.”

Delegated Performance

Claire Bishop focuses on the development of delegated performance as it differs from the criteria that held importance during early performance art. Through the contemporary practice of hiring non-professionals to be present at particular times according to the artist’s instruction, questions concerning the ethics of performative practice which supposes participation in a manner contrasting greatly with its ancestral anti-institutional format. In describing work of this nature Bishop identifies three types of delegated performance; live performance using specific categories of participants.¹⁰⁸ The managerial outsourcing of labor moves beyond voluntary participation, emulating a service industry which is relegated to a mere tacit aspect of the piece. Performers are given shifts, paralleling performance art work with labor and lifting the burden of immediacy from the work thus granting it an energy of sustainability rather than an aura of endurance. The unpaid artist performer, or activist for that matter, is replaced with a model of participation and performance that effects the reception of the work despite it not being the subject of the work itself.

Bishop identifies five types of socially engaged art; direct action, symbolic gestures, consciousness raising, media intervention, and new communities. Her observation was that there was a general lack of vocabulary to engage in meaningful dialogue in more theoretically encompassing terms. While all of the works that she sites are somehow related through their participatory principles, there are certain characteristics and terms that define them and allow her to categorize them as community-based art, experimental communities, dialogic art, littoral art, interventionist art, participatory art, collaborative art, contextual art and (most recently) social practice. Bishop points out that this lattermost term no longer employs the word art at all. In all of these approaches there is alteration which takes place in the classic roles of artist, object, and audience. Here these roles are transformed into collaborator or producer of situations, on-going or long-term project, and co-producer or participant, respectively.¹⁰⁹

¹⁰⁸ Claire Bishop. 2012. *Artificial Hells*. London: Verso. pp. 224-226.

¹⁰⁹ Claire Bishop. *Artificial Hells*. 2.

Suzanne Lacy offers a model for an evaluative construct which portrays the audience as “a series of concentric circles with concentric membranes that allow continual movement back and forth.” The aim is to describe the phenomena of interactivity through the proposal of a nonhierarchical model which incorporates different levels of responsibility. The layers of the concentric model of reception move from the genesis of the work. Lacy describes “actively functioning participatory work” as those where there is “movement between levels of engagement [...] designed into the system” where “the more responsibility assumed, the more central the participants’ role in the generation of the work.”¹¹⁰

Lacy marries genesis with responsibility equating it with the creative impulse, placing it in the central role of the diagram which she likens to rings of water that emanate from a stone tossed into a pond. The piece’s existence is contingent on the protagonists representing this central role. It is from here that factors such as time energy and identity invested in the work become relevant and play an important role in proximity to the center. Although in direct contact with the core of the work and also instrumental to its existence, it is not necessary for the work’s existence. These various layers of experience of, investment in, and engagement with, map the ‘open-ended invitational properties of a community-based artwork’ from its inception through the creation of a commonly held possibility or legacy (myth and memory).¹¹¹

In delegated performance and socially engaged art the passive role of spectatorship is shifted to the active role of the participant. In this sense these pieces are concerned with possible utopian alternatives where the restoration and realization of shared social engagement can take place. Presenting a binate situation and holding it in a dialectical balance carries contradiction or paradox within itself which appeals to Bishop as a powerful form of artistic expression which avoids proposing an alternative or solution. The artist is both grounded in and suspends reality, and does this via a mediating object or third term.¹¹²

Reenactments are commonly associated with that of battles, while social disobedience is often commemorated through a gathering or march. Jeremy Deller employed the device of reenactment in his 2001 piece *The Battle of Orgreave (An Injury to One is an Injury to All)* in order to bring the 1984 strike by the *National Union of Mineworkers* into the present. In the work he blurs the

¹¹⁰ Suzanne Lacy. 2010. *Leaving Art: Writings on Performance, Politics, and Publics, 1974–2007*. Durham and London: Duke University Press. p. 179.

¹¹¹ *Ibid.*, 180.

¹¹² See [Creative Time]. 2017. *Claire Bishop’s “Participation and Spectacle: Where Are We Now?”*.

boundaries between seemingly objective documentation and historical artifacts and residual memory. Deller's piece looks at how the past can inform in the present.¹¹³ Through the staged reenactment of the riot, Deller brings the events to life at a moment when tools of discernment are available to us either through our memory, documentation, or representation. In doing so we are able to access the moment through Deller's detailed taxonomy which "mastered the detailed unfolding of the historical event itself, managing to bring together different scenes of the struggle into the same frame. [...] In Deller's re-enactment these "participants" are his "subjects" as well as his "subject matter," in all their varied roles and positions."¹¹⁴ His choreography echoes the worker's dissent, their pursuit and the state violence that, in their original manifestation, were a performance of policy and legislation. It is these events (protest, battle, manifestation, festival) that create the pivotal moments around which memory, history and myth are woven.

According to Bishop, through taking part in participatory art we, as a medium, are entangled in a "double ontological status." We are at once involved in an episode taking place in the world while being once removed from it as well. In this sense both spectator and participants experience two levels of communication; the "paradoxes that are repressed in everyday discourse" and "disturbing and pleasurable experiences that enlarge our capacity to imagine the world and our relations anew." That which permits this experience to exert influence on public cognizance and imagination is "a mediating third term – an object, image, story, film, even a spectacle."

II.7. You Take the High Road and I'll Take the Low Road

Czechs maintain a close societal relationship to nature and pagan ritual related to the changing of the seasons. From the earliest age they are initiated into the practice of recognizing and picking up mushrooms, orientation in the forest, and the phenomenon of the "výlet" or "trip" which can be anything from an afternoon walk in the countryside, a climb in the mountains, or a drive in the car, with absolutely no particular destination in mind. Trails and routes have been blazed and marked throughout the entire country using a system of colored symbols which are maintained voluntarily by members of the Czech Tourist Club dating back to 1889. Another major contribution to the Czech relationship to the countryside and the forest in particular is law 289/1995/19/1, based on legislature dating back to the Austro-Hungarian Empire, which states:

¹¹³ Andrew Wilson. 2012. *The Battle of Orgreave Archive (An Injury to One is an Injury to All)*. London: Tate Gallery.

¹¹⁴ Stuart Hall. 2012. *Jeremy Deller's Political Imaginary*. In Ralph Rugoff, Rob Young. *Jeremy Deller: Joy in People*. London: Hayward Publishing. p. 83.

Anyone has the right to enter the forest at their own risk, including the right to pick berries for their own consumption and gather dry twigs from the ground. They are obliged to not harm or disrupt the forest environment in any way and to follow the rules of the owner, renter, or employees of the forest.¹¹⁵

An important factor that contributed to the Czech relationship to the land is the restrictions that were enforced on travel during the communist era. In addition to creating a national hobby and past time out of gardening and travel to weekend summerhouses and cottages, it made the countryside and forest a place of refuge for alternative minded individuals and creative activity. For example the Czech Indian movement which is documented in the Canadian film *If Only I Were an Indian* (1995) which begins with a group of young people packing up their cars and driving away from the socialist housing project where they live during the week to head for the freedom of the countryside where they in essence ‘become’ Indians for the weekend. They inhabit a space between reenactment, living history, and performance of the notion of freedom based on historical accounts and romantic legend.

The countryside in addition to fulfilling the role of insular leisure time also became a site for inconspicuous meeting. Polish dissident Mirosław Jasiński describes how Czech and Polish dissidents exchanged their packages in the mountains thinking up female names for the stone markers along the border which would indicate precise meeting points.

The Czech and Slovak Republics were officially divided into two states in January 1993. Jan Symon’s documented walk along the Czech-Slovak border in 2003, over a total of 11 days, was sparked by a curiosity of the effects of this new status in the border areas. Symon describes his trip as a pilgrimage but also as a walking piece in which he leaves himself open for anything to happen. The forested area where he was walking is for Symon a kind of ambiguous space where established norms and regulations are blurred or somehow do not apply as they do once one is closer to the cities. Unlike highly regulated borders, the Czech-Slovak border of the time of his piece was not aggressively indicated or enforced. The series of photographs that resulted from his walk are lush in color and form. Jan spoke about his choice of using color photographs suggesting that they are rich in information as opposed to the historicizing effect that black and white photographs have. The project took place at a time when relatively freshly established boundaries meant something other than they did in the period when the passage between such delineated spaces such as the Czech-

¹¹⁵ Czech Forest Law 289/1995 Sb. III. *General Forest Usage*, § 19.1. *Forest Usage*.

Austrian border were highly regulated in an extreme and often dangerous manner.

In the piece *Airport for Clouds* (1970) by Jan Steklík huge sheets of white paper were layed out on a field, they alone able to fly over the closed border, their presence in the landscape derived from a need other than a dialogue with nature as such or the visual lay of the land. This often cited piece is significant in how it brings together an area loaded with opposing symbolism; the open area indicating mobility and freedom and the psychological space of an impenetrable border.

The pronouncement of a site of sacred significance sees the creation of an entirely new route to be followed and explored. Among the many well established pilgrimage sites in the Czech Republic is the one to Říp Mountain, according to legend the first Slavic settlement established by those led to these lands by forefather Čech. Křižovnická škola čistého humoru bez vtipu group organized a geological pilgrimage accessing the north face of the mountain and made plans to make future excursions.

Ritual in nature is not so much a reoccurring theme or a backdrop in many of the works of Czech performance artists but rather a specific site to enter into a dialogue with. Intermedia artist Miloš Šejn has used meandering and physical contact with the earth as a process since the early 1960s reacting to the spaces and perceived forces of his chosen sites, often caves and gorges. Šejn's descriptions of his perception of nature during his countryside meanderings through Český ráj and the Krkonoš region evoke a dynamic field of complex relationships between himself and the sensory perception of reality." Performative work created in the last decade at the Performance Studio at FaVU has continued to portray a creative and romantic relationship to the landscape and forest. It has endured as a paradigm in these works of a particularly performative nature but has also served as a rich background and setting for numerous video works. The unique accessibility to the countryside that is a legal right in the Czech Republic creates the possibility of routes of creative exploration and discovery into the well-chartered and maintained forests and open lands.¹¹⁶

City, nature and wilderness walking are historically deeply rooted practices and working methods in artistic practice. Walking has seen a renaissance in the last decade in terms of its signage, documentation and mapping. Wayfinding historically refers to the techniques used by travelers, whether on land or by sea to navigate unmarked territory through the use of orientation methodologies. Today wayfinding is applied in a sense closer to its usage as described by scholar, urban planner and early proponent of mental mapping, Kevin A. Lynch in *The Image of the City* from 1960, as "a consistent use and organization of definite sensory cues from the external

¹¹⁶ Jiří Zemánek. 2006. *Chůze, cesta, stopy*.

environment.” It is the user experience of orientation and choosing a path within the built environment. He uses the term ‘imageability’ which he describes as the “quality in a physical object which gives it a high probability of evoking a strong image in any given observer. It is that shape, color, or arrangement which facilitates the making of vividly identified, powerfully structured, highly useful mental images of the environment. It might also be called legibility, or perhaps visibility in a heightened sense, where objects are not only able to be seen, but are presented sharply and intensely to the senses.”

The Legible Cities movement, initiated in Bristol in the late 1990s, takes its inspiration from Kevin A Lynch, and his concept of the “legibility” of urban space. A graphically consistent network of new directional signs, street information panels with maps, printed maps, and plaques creating suggested navigation routes through the city was established through the use of analogue ‘monoliths.’¹¹⁷ Martin Foessleitner describes how historically the scope of the land which we are generally familiarized with covers a 40km square area, in the urban environment this is significantly decreased and encompasses merely several streets. The city is in fact a conglomeration of villages or, as we call them, neighborhoods. Through the building of a mental map, our movement becomes second nature, we rely on markings, signs, landmarks whether intended as such or not to guide us through our routes. In a similar fashion the Legible City Concept¹¹⁸ works toward removing information rather than adding, less is more. The reduction of information Foessleitner describes as a formula of being strong, short, simple, sweet, seducing. If we look at Fultons graphic announcements for his projects and walks they tend to follow this formula. Time frames also are an integral factor in the legible city signage, in tourist signage as well as in the scores or descriptions of art walks. Other components include the indicators and markers of direction or additional information.¹¹⁹

Commerce plays a significant role in the marking out of these routes. The economy of way-marking is evident in the system of symbols employed by the American Hobo used in the late 19th and early 20th century. A visual code was developed which could be written in chalk or coal to provide information, directions, or warnings. Hobo markings are based on an economy of survival and passage rather than moving from point to point or encouraging the discovery of points of interest.

Where previously a well worn path and lore were the indicators, the cities and countryside are now dotted with posts detailing the history of the site, indicating landmarks, flora and fauna or commemorating significant geological or historical events. Land is delineated into categorized areas

¹¹⁷ Steven Poole. 21 August 2014. *Are better signs the secret to a successful city?*. The Guardian, International Edition.

¹¹⁸ Studio Lacoock Gullam. 2016. *Legible London*.

¹¹⁹ Andrew Stuck. 2016. *Interview with Martin Foessleitner*. London: Talking Walking.

and its status as either public or private land has a significant effect on accessibility and the walking culture that grows up around these laws. Through the work of artist-walkers various layers of what a route or path may be can be challenged, the changing characteristics based on legislature can be revealed, and the significance of the rhythm of human movement can be revisited and employed as a knowledge and experience seeking tool.

The month long journey to Venice which František Skála embarked on in May 1993 and documented through diary entries and detailed drawings to later be presented at the 45th Venice Bienale as its Czech representative serves as an complex example which incorporates various elements of art walking and the art of walking. Not only was he retracing the route undertaken by Czech romantic lyrical poet Karel Hynek Mácha in 1834 and in so enforcing its significance as a pilgrimage route, but through the goal of reaching an art venue and event of the highest institutional order, evokes the traditional ‘wander’ of the artisand and craftsmen who would walk the land in search of apprenticeship and work experience oftentimes to Austria and Italy.

The time frame and circumstances of Skala’s wander explores several of the aforementioned nuanced forms of inquiry; walking in the footsteps of those that came before, surveying the interconnection of where borders meet, retracing the emotional investment embedded in a set of instructions or path set out for us, examining the relationship between countryside and the built-up zones we inhabit, the correlation between public and private space. Walking is a radical yet unassuming form of inquiry, its intensity ranging according to the parameters of the given preambulation. Only through the time-space granted through the human step can these cross sections be perceived in such a detailed spectrum.

Conclusion

The preceding chapters explored numerous approaches to the creation and interpretation of scores. Some of the shared features of scores that have been addressed include the framing of experience and the degrees of openness that have been granted to interpreters for future interpretations.

Working through the notion of performance or the performative, a trajectory has been traced through the various aspects of scores, notation, and their interpretation with which this work is concerned. Various manifestations of intentional or socially formed scores serve as examples. The deconstruction of performance work reveals their potential and application as transcending a personal expressionist form of artistic creation and interpretation. The interpretation of scores is investigated through a hermeneutical approach to interpretation as detailed by Hans-Georg

Gadamer and analogous to the aesthetic theory of John Dewey. Through the investigation of scores and their interpretation, I have proposed a theory for the role that experience plays in how these works can be constructed. Widening the scope of research to include areas such as reenactment, festival, myth, and manifestos, structures are revealed, and reoccurrences traced as examples of the objectification of individual works in which the role of experience is pivotal for its interpretation and reception. There is a commonality of form that can best be characterized as the open score.

III. Practical Application – Doctoral Project

Art-Research Bridge

The *Intuition Conference* was conceived as an exploration and examination of intuition in terms of its role as a tool for navigation and interpretation and its perception and practical application in the digital age over a range of cultural and professional fields. The conference was part of a larger project entitled Art-Research Bridge that took place in cooperation with the Department of Cultural Studies at Iceland University (DCS IS) and the Faculty of Fine Arts at Brno University of Technology (FFA BUT). The premise of the Art-Research Bridge was the creation of a model project for a proposed collaboration between the Vasulka Chamber and the developing Vašulka Kitchen project in Brno.¹²⁰

The first session took place at the Vasulka Chamber and was hosted by Kristín Scheving. Director Halldór Björn Runólfsson spoke extensively about the work and artistic practices of Steina and Woody Vasulka, best described as a dialogue with system designers and with the processing tools they engage with. Four works were created and presented during a one-week residency at the National Gallery of Iceland. These works included Slávo Krekovič's *Playing Steina Playing the Maiden; Lava* by Ladislav Tejml¹²¹ and Andreas Gajdošík's *From East to West*,¹²² reminiscent of early experimental pieces by the Vašulkas in which a landscape or domestic scene becomes a meaningful stage for the performance of processing tools.¹²³ The video work *Index: Vašulka*

¹²⁰ During the course of this doctoral research, two unsuccessful grant proposals were made to the Norwegian Funds program in an effort to establish a mirror project to the Vasulka Chamber in Brno. Attempts to develop the project within the Faculty of Fine Arts were also unsuccessful. A proposal was made to the City of Brno to consider the establishment or support of such an institution. The Vašulka Kitchen is scheduled to open in October 2018 as a partner institution of the Brno House of Arts.

¹²¹ Ladislav Tejml. 2015. *Lava*.

¹²² Andreas Gajdošík. 2015. *From East to West*.

¹²³ Woody and Steina Vašulka. 1974-2000. *Video Works*.

Archive was conceived as a means in which to address the archiving of analogue prints from the video works of the Vasulkas. Performing the archive in *Index: Vašulka Archive* addresses the preciousness that preservation of ephemeral works necessitates while creating an experience of their beauty as a sequence of images.

Intuition Conference

The second Art-Research Bridge meeting took place in Brno, Czech Republic between October 17 and 24, 2015. The meeting was conceived as an international conference. Its aim was to examine and reflect on intuition in the digital era. The conference's premise was the phenomenon of willing participation in an extensive process of providing experiences and information that reshape the algorithms of being in the world, both analogue and digital, as well as the tendency to rely on sources one has actively sought. These activities create a new type of social intelligence which continues to rely on the experience of the physical world but incorporates experiences from the digital realm. Through the desire for programs to be given an awareness of certain human behavioral patterns, assumptions are made based on intuitive choices and actions, and a record of experience thereby is established. What has been entered into the system is offered back, tailored according to the intuitive choices that were made. In a kind of a cyclical backlash, one is presented with an assumption of what one desires.

The *Intuition Conference* took place at two venues, the *Methodical Center of Modern Architecture* at Villa Stiassni and the *Open Gardens Educational Center*, with twenty-three participants from six countries. Papers and presentations spanning a range of subjects on art and technology were presented in English and Czech. The *Intuition Reader* features contributions from all but three of the conference participants. The topics addressed at the conference spanned numerous topics, including contemplations on intuition from a philosophical perspective, intuitive approaches to artistic creation, tacit knowledge, and the navigation of new theoretical, ecological, and social terrains.¹²⁴

The Art-Research Bridge project was coordinated in close cooperation with Hlynur Helgason, Kristín Scheving, Monika Šimková, and Kateřina Horáčková. Michaela Čížková and Jonáš Svoboda

¹²⁴ Accompanying publication to doctoral thesis. Jennifer Helia DeFelice (Ed.). 2018. *Intuition*. Brno: FFA BUT.

were responsible for photography and video documentation respectively. An archive of the presentations is available on line.¹²⁵

Vašulka Kitchen Brno

In 2014, Steina and Woody initiated a meeting between Brno-based artist Tomáš Ruller and Kristín Scheving, an artist and the head of the Vasulka Chamber in Reykjavík, Steina's hometown, in an effort to create a mirror project for Brno, Woody's hometown.

The Kitchen, the art collective founded by Steina and Woody in 1971 and originally located at the *Mercer Arts Center* in New York, also serves as a model. A virtual and physical space bringing together open-minded, playful, and curious individuals with vision to emulate that early community that grew up around video which Woody describes as a “strong, cooperative, [and] welcoming tribe.” In the words of the Vasulkas, from their original Kitchen Manifesto, a “place ... selected by Media God to perform an experiment on you, to challenge your brain and its perception.”

In late 2015, the City of Brno was approached with a request to consider taking a lead role in making the creation of a dedicated site for the project a reality. In March 2018, after considerable effort and the establishment of an independent civic association,¹²⁶ the Brno City Council officially approved the creation of a Vašulka Kitchen center for the presentation and preservation of the Vašulka archive and legacy. The center is presently being developed collaboratively by the Vašulka Kitchen Center for New Media Art Association and the House of Arts Brno.

¹²⁵ Media Archive Presents: Konference INTUICE/INTUITION. <http://media-archiv.ffa.vutbr.cz/cyklus.php?id=2>

¹²⁶ The Vašulka Kitchen Brno – Center for New Media Art association was established in June 2016. Its current members are Jennifer Helia DeFelice, Chris Hill, Jana Horáková, Viktor Pantuček, Terezie Petišková, Tomáš Ruller, Kristín Scheving, Marika Svobodová, Woody & Steina Vasulka, and Miloš Vojtěchovský.